Beginning of

A study of some of the universal religious tendencies in pre-literate man

This title was preceded by

The theological basis of Christian ethics in Emil Brunner

And is continued by

Religious education : Arlington Avenue Fellowship House

Search by title on archive.org to continue reading this collection of Pacific School of Religion Theses from 1939
call number Thesis Cage 1939 v.2

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2025 with funding from
Graduate Theological Union

https://archive.org/details/studyofsomeofuni00unse

A STUDY OF SOME OF THE UNIVERSAL RELIGIOUS TENDENCIES IN PRE-LITERATE MAN

By

Thomas Cook

B.A., University of California, 1925

Thesis

Submitted in the

Department of Philosophy of Religion
and Christian Theology

in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

Bachelor of Divinity

in the

Pacific School of Religion

1939

A STUDY OF SOME OF THE UNIVERSAL RELIGIOUS

TENDENCIES IN PRE-LITERATE MAN

By

Thomas Cook

B.A., University of California, 1929

Thesis

Submitted in the

Department of Philosophy of Religion
and Christian Theology

In partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

Bachelor of Divinity

in the

Pacific School of Religion

1939

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
	Statement of Problem	1
	Methods	5
II.	THE INDIVIDUAL AS A FACTOR IN SHAPING PRE-LITERATE RELIGIONS	8
III.	THEORIES OF THE ORIGIN OF RELIGION	12
IV.	THE IDEA OF THE NUMINOUS IN PRE-LITERATE RELIGIONS	29
V.	CASE HISTORIES	33
	Cases of Conversion Showing the Integration of Personality which Resulted from Mystical Experiences	33
	Case History of Red-Shirt Jim.	33
	Case History of Malwida von Meysenbug.	35
	Case History of Thunder Cloud.	41
	Case History of Crashing Thunder	47
	Case History of Oxford Graduate.	52
	Cases Illustrating Fear and Awe as Part of the Religious Experience.	56
	Case History of Katek.	56
	Case History Illustrating Faith, Love and Mysticism.	59
	Case History of Nora Coonskin.	59
	Neurotic Tendencies in Religion as Illustrated by Shamanism	64
	Case History of Ainenwat	65
	Case History of Niron.	66
	Suitability of a Particular Religion for a Particular Environment	67
VI.	SUMMARY	71
VII.	CONCLUSION	75
APPENDIX		79
	A Christian Mystical Experience.	79
	Chuckchee Shamanism.	80
	The Individual in a Pre-literate Social Group	81
	Neurasthenia	82
	Peyote Cult	84
	Scarification.	85
BIBLIOGRAPHY		86

Chapter

I. INTRODUCTION 1

Statement of Problem 1
Methods 5

II. THE INDIVIDUAL AS A FACTOR IN SHAPING PRE-LITERATE RELIGIONS 8

III. THEORIES OF THE ORIGIN OF RELIGION 12

IV. THE IDEA OF THE NUMINOUS IN PRE-LITERATE RELIGIONS 29

V. CASE HISTORIES 38

Cases of Conversion Showing the Integration of Personality which Resulted from Mystical Experiences 38
Case History of Red-Shirt Jim. 39
Case History of Waluda von Veyenburg. . 39
Case History of Thunder Cloud. 41
Case History of Creeping Thunder 47
Case History of Oxford Graduate. 52
Cases Illustrating Fear and Awe as Part of the Religious Experience. 56
Case History of Faith. 56
Case History Illustrating Faith, Love and Mysticism. 59
Case History of Nora Coonskin. 59
Neurotic Tendencies in Religion as Illustrated by Shamanism 64
Case History of Ajaneweh 65
Case History of Niron. 66
Suitability of a Particular Religion for a Particular Environment 67

VI. SUMMARY 71

VII. CONCLUSION 75

APPENDIX 79
A Christian Mystical Experience. 79
Chuckchee Shamanism. 80
The Individual in a Pre-Literate Social Group 81
Neurasthenia 82
Peyote Cult 84
Sanctification. 85

BIBLIOGRAPHY 86

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Statement of Problem

No one has yet revealed what may be the underlying instincts or tendencies which make man a religious being. Although there are extant several thousand definitions of religion,[1] none have yet defined religion adequately.[2] Like beauty or art it seems to be indefinable, yet all men are

---

[1] Edward Clodd, Animism, (Chicago: Open Court Publishing Co., 1906), p. 9, quoting John Morley in The Nineteenth Century, April, 1903: "There are said to be ten thousand definitions of religion."

[2] J. B. Pratt, The Religious Consciousness, (New York: 1921), p. 1: "Hence all definitions of religion are more or less arbitrary and should be taken rather as postulates than as axioms."

Again, William James, Varieties of Religious Experience, (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1902), pp. 26 ff.: "The word 'religion' cannot stand for any single principle or essence, but is rather a collective name....let us rather admit freely at the outset that we may very likely find no one essence, but many characters which may alternately be equally important."

This statement is generally accepted by all anthropologists and others of importance.

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Statement of Problem

No one has yet revealed what may be the underlying instincts or tendencies which make men a religious being. Although there are extant several thousand definitions of religion,[1] none have yet defined religion adequately.[2] Like beauty or art it seems to be indefinable, yet all men are

---

[1] Edward Clodd, *Animism*, (Chicago: Open Court Publishing Co., 1905), p. 9, quoting John Morley in The Nineteenth Century, April, 1903: "There are said to be ten thousand definitions of religion."

[2] J. B. Pratt, The Religious Consciousness, (New York: 1921), p. 1: "Hence all definitions of religion are more or less arbitrary and should be taken rather as postulates than as axioms."

Again, William James, Varieties of Religious Experience, (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1902), pp. 26 ff.: "The word 'religion' cannot stand for any single principle or essence, but is rather a collective name....let us rather admit freely at the outset that we may very likely find no one essence, but many characters which may alternately be equally important."

This statement is generally accepted by all anthropologists and others of importance.

religious, whether ancient[1] or modern, pre-literate[2] or civilized.

Until very recent times this field of speculation has been the exclusive property of the philosophers. Now we have the more pragmatic approach of the biologist and the psychologist, anthropologist and finally of the theologian.

Some of these people have attempted to demonstrate that the origin of religion lies in a sublimation of certain physiological functions, notably Freud, in his advocacy of the idea of the sexual origin of religions, using the term sexual in its wider sense. Others have approached the matter from the psychological angle, particularly C. G. Jung, who explains all activities as springing from a single life-urge.[3]

---

[1] R. R. Marett, Psychology and Folk Lore, (New York: The Macmillan Co., 1920), p. 238: "Before we leave the Mousterians, another side of their culture deserves brief mention. Not only did they provide their dead with rude graves, but they likewise furnished them with implements and food for use in a future life. Herein we may perceive the dawn of what I do not hesitate to term religion. A sympathy stronger than death, overriding its grisly terrors and converting it into the vehicle of a larger hope--that is the work of soul; and to develop soul is progress."

A. L. Kroeber, Anthropology, (Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1922), p. 156, states that the Mousterian people were members of the Neanderthal race who lived in the Paleolithic Age from 50,000 to 25,000 years ago.

[2] The term, "pre-literate" will be used in this paper for peoples of relatively simple cultures, usually illiterate, often ambiguously called "savage," "primeval," "primitive," etc.

[3] L. F. Shaffer, The Psychology of Adjustment, (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1936), p. 85: "The most influential of the monistic instinct theories is that of Jung, who describes the 'libido' as a single all-important life urge, supplying the energy for all activities. This concept is almost identical with Bergson's 'élan vital' or life force."

religious, whether ancient[2] or modern, pre-literate[3] or civilized.

Until very recent times this field of speculation has been the exclusive property of the philosopher. Now we have the more pragmatic approach of the biologist and the psychologist, anthropologist and finally of the theologian.

Some of these people have attempted to demonstrate that the origin of religion lies in a sublimation of certain physiological functions, notably Freud, in his advocacy of the idea of the sexual origin of religions, using the term sexual in its wider sense. Others have approached the matter from the psychological angle, particularly C. G. Jung, who explains all activities as springing from a single life-urge.[3]

---

[1] R. R. Marett, Pyschology and Folk Lore, (New York: The Macmillan Co., 1920), p. 236: "Before we leave the Monsterians, another side of their culture deserves brief mention. Not only did they provide their dead with rude graves, but they likewise furnished them with implements and food for use in a future life. Herein we may perceive the dawn of what I do not hesitate to term religion. A sympathy stronger than death, overriding its grisly terrors and converting it into the vehicle of a larger hope--thus is the work of soul; and to develop soul is progress."

[2] A. L. Kroeber, Anthropology, (Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1923), p. 186, states that the Mousterian people were members of the Neanderthal race who lived in the Paleolithic Age from 50,000 to 25,000 years ago.

[3] The term, "pre-literate" will be used in this paper for peoples of relatively simple cultures, usually illiterate, often ambiguously called "savage," "primeval," "primitive," etc.

[4] L. P. Shaffer, The Psychology of Adjustment, (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1936), p. 881: "The most influential of the monistic insistent theories is that of Jung, who describes the 'libido' as a single all-important life urge, supplying the energy for all activities. This concept is almost identical with Bergson's 'élan vital' or life force."

Others have attempted to interpret the origin of life and its resultant interactions, including religion, on a physio-chemical basis.

Anthropologists have propounded many theories, some to the effect that primitive religion arose from pragmatic considerations on the part of early man. Some suggest that religion grew out of illogical speculations concerning the vicissitudes of life, or concerning the phenomenon of death.

The explanation of the origin of religion is often attributed to a single factor, such as fear, wonder, awe, wishful thinking, hope, frustration, the maternal instinct, or love. It would appear more reasonable to suppose that religion arose and functions through the whole man, not alone through heredity or environment, nor through any gland or other special bodily organ, nor yet through any specific mental or social relationship.

Whatever the validity of these explanations may be, the fact remains that religion exists irrespective of historical age or landscape. The Esquimau is not very likely to develop the same kind of religious experience nor carry on the same ceremonies as the desert nomad. However, both have religion.

As the original instincts or biological tendencies of the young child begin to develop and coordinate more perfectly, he becomes susceptible to, and responds to religious influences. This response seems to reach its maximum development in early adulthood. It is not present in animals, but is the exclusive endowment of all races of men. The social

setting of the youth largely determines his religious practices and beliefs; his temperamental proclivities will determine their intensity, whether he shall be a mystic, a spiritual leader, or merely one of the congregation. Each young human biological entity has already been stamped with the image of immortality and can and does respond to things holy.

True it seems, as Radin expresses it:

> A cursory glance at the religious beliefs of peoples shows that almost any belief or custom can and has at different times become associated with religious feeling. This can be explained in only one way,--by regarding religion, not as a phenomenon apart and distinct from mundane life, not as a philosophical inquiry into the nature of being or as a group of concepts and acts that spring from the relation of the individual to the outer world, but, broadly speaking, as one of the most important and distinctive means of maintaining life-values. As these vary, so will the religious complex vary. In other words, religion will only emphasize and preserve those values that are accepted by the majority of the group at any given time. Religion is thus closely connected with the whole life of man; and only when other means of emphasizing and maintaining life-values are in the ascendant, does it become divorced from the corporate life of the community. This divorce has never taken place among primitive man, and religion consequently permeates every phase of his culture. It does not, however, permeate every phase equally, with the same intensity, or with the same permanency; and in this variability lies, it seems to me, the possibility of discussing religion apart from all other aspects of the life of a group, as well as the possibility of separating the religion of one people from that of another.[1]

Nevertheless, we believe that primitive man was endowed with religious proclivities before he became aware of himself or before he developed creeds and ceremonies and began to rationalize them. We cannot agree entirely with Dr. Radin when he contends "that religion springs from the rela-

---

[1] Paul Radin, "Religion of North American Indians," The Journal of American Folk-Lore, Vol. XXVII., No.CVI., (October-December, 1914), p. 336.

tion of the spirits to the life-values of man."[1] Judging from the evidence available, it would seem that religion is co-existant with man from the beginning. At the instant man became aware of the "something other" "the incomprehendable beyond," or whatever term is used to express reality, he then became an unique animal, that is, man. Thus in this certain sense religion is revealed.

Methods

We will consider the savage, and to some extent civilized man as he appears before God, taking account of the modifying influences of his social, geographical or biological determinants. We will study man, as far as the data is available in terms of what he says himself concerning his beliefs, rather than in terms of mere speculation. This method seems to me to be a legitimate approach, both logical and scientific.

---

[1]Radin, Ibid., p. 337, writes: "In the midst of the variability of life-values, three stand out prominently and tenaciously; and they are success, happiness, and long life. In the same way there stand out, from the heterogeneous mass of beliefs, the belief in spirits who bestow success, happiness, and long life. These life-values are in no way inherently connected with the spirits, and may, we know, be obtained in another way; for instance, by magical rites. Our constant element is consequently the life-values. The association of these values with spirits may justifiably be regarded as secondary, and not as necessarily flowing from the nature of the spirit as originally conceived. Is it not, then, emphatically putting the cart before the horse to contend that 'religion springs from the relation of the individual to the outer world (i.e., the spirits)?' Is it not just the converse that is true, that religion springs from the relation of the spirits to the life-values of man? In North America I am certain that this is the case." Italics mine.

The technique to be used, where the data is available, will be an objective, comparative study of the personal testimonies of a number of pre-literate individuals, with similar statements from literate men concerning their reactions to religious beliefs, based on an analysis of these statements by competent observers. We shall attempt to show that all men, primitive or civilized react in religious matters in fundamentally the same way, and that man has an innate tendency to seek God, irrespective of the amount or kind of conditioning by his socio-religious heritage.

When carrying on research in the mathematical sciences, an error of one tenth of one per cent is sometimes allowable; in the field of biology perhaps five per cent error is acceptable.

We must recognize that in applying the scientific method to sociological or religious subjects, we are confronted with so many variables entering into the problem that the error of probability of proof is very high.

However an attempt has been made to collect some of the scanty first hand evidence of what we choose to call "case histories" of primitive religionists, and an effort has been made to classify this data in an orderly sequence, drawing generalizations from the findings. Lastly the writer has tried to suggest some kind of an hypothesis for comparisons with the testimonies of literary religionists. These latter case histories are inserted, to act, as it were, as some form of control, or norm for evaluating the testimonies of pre-literate religious beliefs.

There is no direct way of experimenting with or measuring matters of religious interests, therefore we are compelled to resort to the case history method. Consequently, the findings or conclusions are merely tentative and suggestive, especially since our data is so scanty.

CHAPTER II

THE INDIVIDUAL AS A FACTOR IN SHAPING PRE-LITERATE RELIGIONS

Much has been written concerning tribal beliefs and customs of pre-literate peoples. Comparatively little has been said concerning the unit who forms these beliefs--namely the individual.[1] The purpose of this chapter is to search out his importance in shaping the religious views of his group, in so far as it is possible by means of available religious and anthropological data.

The usual and general method of formulating the religious tradition of primitive races is to study a number of individuals and then to draw conclusions concerning the beliefs of the whole group. Paradoxically the prime source of information is usually ignored. It goes without saying that each individual must have his own variations and his own bit of influence, however small, upon the total credo. It is as if an inhabitant of Mars should descend upon our country and proceed to interview a cross-section of the population concerning their religious beliefs, then upon re-

---

[1] Some of the older anthropologists were of the opinion that "the individual was submerged in his tribal life," as expressed by Irving King, The Development of Religion, (New York: The Macmillan Co., 1910), p.330. This viewpoint is no longer tenable. For further discussion of this subject see appendix; The Individual in a Pre-literate Social group.

turning to his planet published a book on Christianity in America with very little reference to the different types of Christians, much less to individual psychological variations found among members of a single sect.

Thus Dr. Lowie,[1] roughly, and it must be admitted, tentatively, classifies the religious manifestations appearing in various localities. For instance, he speaks of the visionary type of religion as predominant in North America, animism in South America, ancestor worship in China, elaborate ritualism in Mayan culture, fetishism in Africa, and ghost worship in Polynesia, etc. This may hold true for the mass or for the religious leaders of the groups, but it tells little of the individual who accepts or modifies the tradition handed down to him. It is our contention that it is the ordinary, unspectacular individual who gradually and almost imperceptibly moulds the religious thought of the whole. Before any sensible or radical change can take place, and any leader of a new movement arise and be recognized, ground must be prepared by that separate and yet coherent mass, the members of society. The time must be ripe for the leader to appear for his message to take effect. This brings us to the further point that all religion is in a sense evolutionary, its progress arising out of individual variations.

---

[1]Robert H. Lowie, Primitive Religion,(New York: Boni and Liveright, 1920), p. 173.

It is not our purpose to discuss the genetics of racial groups, but it must be recognized that the individual of any social group living at the present day is the lineal descendent of countless ancestors. Approximately the same number of ancestors preceded the individual of the most primitive peoples living today as well as of the most civilized. The difference in cultural levels is largely due to geographical isolation and to other environmental factors, besides some genetic factors. Whatever the cultural differences in degrees of development may be, we expect to recognize in primitive peoples both past and present, religious hopes and ambitions parallel to our own.

There is in this day of educational advancement no advocate of the theory that some men and most women are without souls. It has long been determined that there are no hybrids amongst mankind. That is to say, we are all, biologically speaking, one species with less variation among varieties of humans than are to be found among the individual members of species in the animal world.

We are also assuming, as Dr. E. B. Tylor, the father of anthropological science inferred, that all men at all times have or had "beliefs in spiritual beings."[1] So far there has been no valid evidence produced to the contrary.

---

[1]E. B. Tylor, Primitive Culture, (London: Watts and Company, 1881), p. 424.

We hope to show that the variations in religious beliefs of the primitive individual influence the religious customs of his tribe. This implies that the religions of pre-literate peoples were not static and that what we see today is the accumulation and accretion of long centuries. There is no record of a people without a religion. Furthermore, we hope to point out that there are general tendencies and general basic responses in the religious make-up of all peoples. That is to say, one may surely recognize his religious affiliations among any primitive peoples.[1]

---

[1] Epigrammatically speaking, one may meet his friends in any savage tribe.

CHAPTER III

THEORIES OF THE ORIGIN OF RELIGION

Religion, like organic development, is a continuous process. Man, like his fellow-mammals, has evolved as was demonstrated in the latter part of the last century. Still there lingers in some quarters the older bias that this holds true only for the body, neglecting or refusing to admid that the psychological and mental difference between man and animals is one of degree only.

Since we can know nothing of mind apart from matter or vice-versa, it would appear that the highest development of mental activity into religious consciousness involves matter. It is not known how the passage of consciousness from the nerve cells of the body is effected. Anatomists have proven that the more complicated or convoluted is the brain structure, the more intelligent is the animal.[1] This is proven in part by the fact that if the brain be injured, consciousness is inhibited. In this respect man is not especially favored above the animals. It would seem that in order to study the religion of man we must know something of his biology and psychology.

---

[1] G. Elliot Smith, The Evolution of Man, (London: Humphrey Milford, 1924), p. 10.

Since unbroken biological and mental development must be recognized in view of modern scientific development, it would seem logical to suppose that religion has followed a similar course.

Let us recount some evidences of the antiquity of religious beliefs in man.

Burial by human hands of the remains of his fellow man may not itself have any religious connotation; but should such a burial be accompanied by evidence of some ceremony, it would at least suggest religious customs. Sir Arthur Keith[1] gives us an illustration of such an orderly burying. Speaking of the graves of the Solutrean people of Early Neolithic times he relates:

> At each side of the head of all these skeletons stood a flat block of limestone; the upper ends of these two blocks, when the burials were freshly made, had projections on the surface to mark the position of the dead and serve as tombstones.

With the graves of another group of pre-historic peoples, namely the Aurignacian, are found ornaments, their implements of stone and bone. Many such burials have been found, dating throughout the Neolithic period. It would seem even from such slight evidence that man had at least an idea of the difference between the living and the dead. A further development of burial customs is evidenced by the Cromelechs, the Stonehenges, the Barrows and Mastabas of peoples of a later date than the Neolithic period. In as much as these

---

[1] Sir Arthur Keith, The Antiquity of Man, (Philadelphia: J. B. Lippencott Co., 1925), Vol. I, p. 91.

monuments are usually of massive stone, they suggest the co-ordinated activity of a number of people to build them. This further suggests an organized society with a purpose. Such structures are found around the Mediterranean basin and in Central and Western Europe. We find primitive people are very practical. Yet it does not seem possible that these large masses of stone could have had a practical or pleasure-ful purpose. It appears, and is generally conceded by anthropologists that they have to do with human burials or religious ceremonies. Another bit of evidence which seems strongly to suggest that Paleolithic peoples knew religion is found in their art. This was one of the highest achievements of the old Stone Age period.

It is with the Auragnacian people that we first meet this development of human culture. The later Paleolithic people carved in ivory, bone, and horn. They modelled clay figurines that, as a rule, represent the human female. The head, hands and feet are either absent or abbreviated. In those parts of the body having to do with reproduction and fertility the model is exaggerated. It is suggested that these figurines had something to do with a fertility or reproductive cult.

Within the caves of Altamira in Spain we find colored pictures of animals. It is conceivable that pre-historic man groped his way deep into the labyrinths of a cave to express himself graphically in his idle moments, but it is more logical to suppose that the motive in drawing pictures of his

food animals or his enemy animals is suggestive of Totemism. In this round-about way we can get some idea from the remote past of such a non-material thing as religion. Thus it is known that as far back as twenty thousand years ago, certain customs were observed by the Neanderthal and other people of western Europe which, when compared with modern savages, have the appearance of being of a religious nature. We have a suggestion of the continued existence of the soul if we compare the way in which a Paleolithic man laid away the dead, accompanied by certain paraphernalia, with known customs of more recent primitive people.

With this brief review of the possibilities of religions by Paleolithic man we turn to the discussion of some theories of the origin of religion among later pre-literate peoples.

E. B. Tylor in his pioneer work "Primitive Culture," 1871, put forward the theory of animism, or belief in spirits or souls (Animae) as the prime force of nature. In this theory, the varied phenomena of nature, both inanimate and animate, might possess a spirit, or some vital force which gave it certain power or movement. An important part of Tylor's theory is that dreams and death suggest to early man a reality of separable souls, which to the untutored mind suggested association with natural objects. From this beginning there arose the various religious beliefs, such as fetishism, totemism, polytheism, polytheistic worship, and finally a belief in one Supreme Spirit. A spirit, according

to the beliefs in most of pre-literate religions, may be both good and bad. More specifically Dr. Tylor thinks primitive people believed in a more refined form of existence than the bodily. He argues "that primitive man distinguishes between the living and the dead and reasons that a something vital was present during life." Furthermore, when a savage sees in a vision or has a dream of some person he knows or imagines, on awakening, he believes he has somehow been absent from his own body. Dr. Tylor further says: "My own view is that nothing but dreams or visions could ever put into men's minds such an idea as that of souls being ethereal images of bodies." Tylor further argues that primitive man combines the two notions in a ghost-soul. From this point, man is supposed to extend the concept of the ghost-soul to other animals and into inanimate things.

Later investigation has modified somewhat Dr. Tylor's theory. One difficulty as pointed out by Dr. Lowie,[1] is that "if we insist on the notion of completely incorporeal being there are probably no examples to be found on primitive levels." Lowie gives the illustration from the Crow Indians where the Sun lures a maiden to the sky and begets a son; the ghosts of the African Ekoi people can be thrown and killed in a wrestling match with other spirits which have quite fleshy bodies. Even in Bible times we have some intimation of souls, conceived of as the life animating the

---

[1]Lowie, op. cit., p. 99.

body. Was not the breath of life breathed into man, according to the story of Genesis?

To this theory, the French sociologist Dr. E. Durkheim[1] strenuously objects on the grounds that there is no reason why primitive man craves a theoretical interpretation of dream life. How he asks, "could a dreamer fail to discover that he had been the dupe of an illusion?" All that the primitive has to do on awakening is to verify his dream experience with the one dreamed of. The answer to this part of Professor Durkheim's argument is that primitive man is not a logical thinker in matters of the abstract, and is not likely to compare notes to check the facts. However, the chief objection to Durkheim's theory is that he is attempting to prove by forced argument his own theory concerning "Totemism." He believes that the basis of all human social and religious organizations begins with Totemism. Durkheim assumes that the oldest conception of religion is found among the Australian aborigines (a fact which in itself is doubtful), who have a Totemic relationship with certain animals and plants. Therefore, he argues that Totemism is the oldest and original form of religion.

After studying Dr. Lowie's criticism of Professor Durkheim on the Tylor theory, neither of whom are theologians, there seems to be something omitted, and that is the inherent sense of numinous in all men, which, so it seems to me, can

---

[1] Emile Durkheim, The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life, Trans. J. W. Swain, (London: George Allen and Unwin, n.d.), p. 87. passim.

not be logically reasoned about but can be felt only. It is this aspect of the subject which interests us mostly.

Man, it seems, is too complex a being, for us to explain him or any of his attributes in terms of one aspect of his life. Certainly his religion cannot be reduced to one formula.

Another theory of the origin of religion among preliterate people is that supported by Dr. Marett.[1] That is the theory of "Mana" as presented before the Third International Congress for the History of Religion in 1908 and further enlarged upon in his book The Threshold of Religion.

The term "Mana" is of Melanesian origin, and is applied colloquially to a wide variety of abstract ideas, much the same as certain words are used colloquially by American women. At least so it seems to me as a result of my personal experience while living with these people. Since the advent of the white people into the South Pacific Islands the word has been further debased and is used sometimes in pidgin English to convey the idea of some unknown quality in some object or person.

Its real meaning is difficult to arrive at, but, according to Dr. F. H. Smith,[2] "it seems to mean a supernatural power manifesting itself in strange or marvelous persons or things, altogether apart from normal physical powers, or

---

[1] R. R. Marett, The Threshold of Religion, (3d.ed.; London: Metheun & Co., Ltd., 1914).

[2] Harrold F. Smith, The Elements of Comparative Theology, (New York: Charles Scribners Son's, 1937), p. 56.

natural human activity." However, "Mana" may be considered impersonal, mysterious and supernatural; it acts both for good and for evil. The negative form of this dualism is "tabu" often anglicized as"taboo."

Dr. Codrington,[1] one of the first men to study this phase of Melanesian religion, defines "Mana" as "a force altogether distinct from physical powers, which acts in all kinds of ways for good and evil and which it is of the greatest advantage to possess or control." Or again he says: "it is a power and influence, not physical, and in a way supernatural." Mana can however show itself in physical force, or as in any kind of superiority which one can possess. The important thing about "Mana" is the fact of its power beyond man's control and its supernatural implications. We have in these Melanesian people the elements of reflection, and an attempt at elementary philosophy to explain the indwelling psychic power of man.

The general concept of the idea back of "Mana," as believed by the Melanesians, is widely distributed. We find it in the Japanese Shinto literature as "Kami." Among the Hurons the same idea is known as "Orenda," and when a misfortune happened to a Maori chief it was apparent to all he had evidently lost his "Mana." The word "maxpe" among the Crow Indians and among the Ekoi the word "Nyomm," according to Dr. Lowie,[2] corresponds to "Mana."

---

[1] R. H. Codrington, The Melanesians, (Oxford: 1891), p. 119.

[2] Lowie, op. cit., p. 47

Thus we see there exists a rudimentary, innate conception of things supernatural among widely scattered preliterate peoples, which, being more specific than animism, has been termed "pre-animistic" by Dr. Marett. It is at this point that Dr. Marett criticizes Tylor's theory of animism as being too narrow and too intellectualistic. Quoting:[1]

> Psychologically, religion involves more than thought, namely, feeling and will as well, and may manifest itself on its emotional side, even when the idea is vague.

Dr. Marett believes that apart from the idea of spirits, ghosts, or souls, and before such ideas have become dominant factors in the constituent experience, a rudimentary religion can exist. For this proto-religion he claims supernaturalism; that is, the attitude of mind dictated by awe of the mysterious. It is this which provides religion with its raw material, and it may exist apart from animism, and further, may provide a basis on which an animistic doctrine is subsequently constructed. According to Dr. Marett,[2]

> objects toward which awe is felt may be termed powers. Of such powers, spirits constitute a single class among many; though being powers in their own right, they furnish a type to which the rest may become assimilated in the long run.

Startling manifestations of nature are treated as powers without the agency of spirits being necessarily assumed. Even when they are regarded as living beings, such "animatism" falls short of "animism" in Tylor's sense. So, Dr. Marett believes this is a view which distinguishes between the spirit and the vehicle, and holds the animating spirit to be more or

---

[1]Marett, The Threshold of Religion, p. 1. ff.

[2]Ibid.

less independent and separable. As an example, blood, and notably the blood of women, is a power in its own account and not because of an associated spirit. Thus Mr. Marett supplements Tylor's theory of animism and endeavors to show there is something wider than animism, needed as a minimum definition of the word religion. Dr. Lowie[1] concurs in this view point. Both of these anthropologists agree, as Lowie says, that

> neither animism nor animatism are essentially non-religious, or only potentially religious, becoming religious only in as far as the emotional attitude characteristic of religion clusters about their objects.

Lowie illustrates his point as follows:

> When a Melanesian distinguishes between a yam and a pig by ascribing to the latter a vital principle, he is, so to speak, on the level of comparative biology, he still adheres to that level when he distinguishes between a pig and a man by attributing to the latter exclusive transformation into a ghost after death.

Dr. Marett[2] interprets religion in the following quotation:

> What we call physical nature may very well be nature also to the savage in most of its normal aspects, yet its more startling manifestations, thunderstorms, eclipses, eruptions, and the like are eminently calculated to awaken in him an awe that I believe to be specifically religious both in its essentials and its fruits, whether animism may have, or have not succeeded in imposing its distinctive color upon it.

A third view of the origin of religion is that put forward by Andrew Lang in 1898.[3] This Scotchman of letters

---

[1] Lowie, op. cit., p. 134.

[2] Marett, The Threshold of Religion, p. 13.

[3] Andrew Lang, The Making of Religion, (3d. ed.; London: Longmans, Green and Co., 1909), p. 160 ff.

was the first to challenge Dr. Tylor's theory of animism in an excellent literary work.

Mr. Lang wanted to know,

> Why must all notions of supernatural beings be arranged in a unilinear series? Why must loftier concepts of the deity grow out of lesser ones?

He points out that some of the higher gods have not necessarily higher ideals, nor have they improved ethically with advancing culture, but on the contrary have lapsed. The chief thought of Lang's theory is the conception of a "high-god" for "low people," the title of one chapter in his book, The Making of Religion.

He maintains that such a high-god could be worshipped by the simplest tribes, one who could be described as a "primeval eternal Being, author of all things, father and friend to man, the invisible omniscient guardian of morality." This Lang claims can be proved, even among tribes who have not been influenced by missionaries. Although Lang agrees with Tylor in part on the origin of spirit concepts, and on the points that the cult of ancestors' spirits, and the cult of demons naturally flowed from the soul, he criticizes Tylor on the idea that a high-god was preceded by one of a lower order. His thought seems to be that high-gods develop independently of the Ghost-Soul-Concept. An illustration of this is as follows, quoting Lowie from Zulu Mythological History:

> In the beginning the Unkulunkulu, was a typical high-god, but the intense development of ancestor-worship lead to his identification with the first man, while the myth-making fancy of the natives made him the hero

> of adventures hardly consistent with a monotheistic divinity as we think of it.[1]

Lang[2] denies that the high-god of primitive tribes need be spiritual:

> To us, such a being is necessarily a spirit, but he was by no means necessarily so to an early thinker, who may not yet have reached a conception of a ghost.

Lang[3] believed that primitives thought of their high-gods as undefined eternal beings or a non-natural man on a grand scale, superior to natural man, not necessarily in a non-visible human body. This idea came to religion at a later date. Lang gives as the origin of this kind of concept the desire of humans for an explanation of origin of all things. Dr. Lowie recognizes this part of Andrew Lang's theory as valid.

In the present day Father Wilhelm Schmidt, had independently developed the same general idea of high-gods among primitive people. Dr. Schmidt[4] believes "the most archaic form of culture now known among living tribes, shares the idea of a high-god." These he lists as Bushmen, Andaman Islanders, Semangs of the Malay Peninsula, Pygmies, and the now extinct Tasmanians. Dr. Schmidt argues "that the high-god is of great antiquity, since it exists among people of the most crude cultures." In spite of the tenacity of religious beliefs among all peoples, both primitive and civ-

---

[1]Lowie, op. cit., p. 121. [2]ibid., p. 122.

[3]Lang, op. cit., passim.

[4]Lowie, op. cit., p. 124., quoting Wilhelm Schmidt, "Origin of the Idea of Idea of God," Anthropos, III,IV,1908-1909.

ilized, it does not necessarily follow that these people retain their original religious concepts. They may have now the remnants of a degenerate culture and religion, or they may have borrowed from other cultures. Furthermore, it is very difficult to state for fact what is a high-god when dealing with primitive peoples. The personal factor of the investigator must be considered, since frequently two persons investigating the same set of facts arrive at different conclusions. Dr. Schmidt was unfortunate in his choice of the Andaman islanders, since two competent observers of these people, viz., Dr. A. R. Brown[1] and Mr. E. H. Man, contradict each other on the interpretation of the religious data collected. Father Schmidt[2] himself says, "that of the primitive culture properly so called hitherto no concrete examples of this can be established, (that is speaking of high-gods) nor is it likely that we shall ever be able to do so directly."

From the above brief outline of the three principal theories advanced concerning the origin of religious beliefs we are expected to deduce the many and varied forms of religion which arose from them.

We accept Dr. Smith's summary of these theories, which are as follows:

> 1. E. B. Tylor was the first writer to give a systematic account of the elementary belief in spirits or souls (animae) as the moving forces of nature. The

---

[1] A. R. Brown, The Andaman Islanders, (Cambridge, England: 1922).

[2] Wilhelm Schmidt, Origin and Growth of Religion, Trans. H. J. Rose, (New York: 1931), p. 240.

> most varied phenomena from sun, sky, cloud or wind to brook, plant or stone might possess a spirit akin to that of a ghost or spiritualized man giving it the power of movement or growth. Tylor maintained that dreams and death suggested to archaic man the reality of separable souls, which he associated also with natural objects. From this initial basis there arose in his view all religious beliefs--fetishism, totemism, polytheism, polytheistic worship, and as a climax, monotheism--the belief in one Supreme Spirit.
>
> The word "animism" is, however, an ambiguous term covering very different kinds of belief. Four, at least, are distinguishable: (1) Animatism; difficult to differentiate from "mana." Objects are just conceived of as alive, or supernatural. (2) Incipient animism; in which the idea of the supernatural is thought of as controlling an object. (3) Animism proper; an external or separable spirit is thought of as controlling an object. (4) Spiritism; spirits are thought of as tenanting the environment unassociated with any material object.
>
> According to Tylor the archaic belief in animism involves the belief in a separable soul.[1]

Dr. T. H. Robinson[2] gives a chart of the philogeny of religions derived from animism. He questions the origin of animism, but thinks that from it we derive Totemism, Fetishism, and Polydaemonism. The Egyptians developed their religion from Totemism. From Polydaemonism is derived Tribal Monolatary and Nature Worship. From Nature worship, the Egyptians, Teutons, Greek Cults, and Persians, derived their beliefs. From Tribal Monolatary the Egyptian, Mesopotamian and Jewish religions evolved; from Judaism, Mohammadism and Christianity; from the Indian Religion we derive Indian Philosophy, Hinduism, and Buddhism.

---

[1]Harrold F. Smith, op. cit., p. 59

[2]Theodore H. Robinson, The History of Religions, (London: Humphrey Milford, 1926), p. 1.

2. If, as we have seen, archaic man could imagine supernatural beings as mental replicas of concrete objects, there seems nothing intrinsically impossible in his having conceived the idea of a high god in quite early times of his development or as Andrew Lang contended, anterior to the notion of a separable spirit. Father W. Schmidt has argued very laboriously in recent times for a primitive monotheism on the ground (1) the lowest surviving savage tribes are elementary enough to allow for valid inference to prehistoric times, (2) archaic man was influenced by "cognitio causarum," (3) his "totalism" (rather than "differentiation") urged him to seek for the cause of the universe as a whole, (4) and his impulse to personify led him to the idea of the Supreme Cause as personal. It is, however, very questionable whether the earliest religion was of one high god, apart from belief in any other kind of supernatural ally whether of the "mana" variety or as imagined supernatural beings. The evidence as yet does not seem to be convincing enough to justify the theory of a primitive monotheism.[1]

The modern savage is indeed a far cry from the earliest type of pre-history. Of the higher religions, which come under our survey, there is no example of a clear or permanent monotheism until the later development of Israel, though ancient Egypt and Persia came to the verge of such a belief.

3. The term "mana" has been taken from Melanesian beliefs and generalized by Dr. Marett to signify the character of all archaic religion. As religion on its most rudimentary level it means a supernatural power manifesting itself in strange or marvellous objects or in striking individuals, altogether distinct from physical power, or natural human activity. It is not conceived as personal, but is just thought of as mysterious and supernatural, and acts in all kinds of

---

[1]Wilhelm Schmidt says that of the primitive (--prehistoric) culture properly so called: "hitherto no concrete examples of this can be established anywhere, nor is it likely that we shall ever be able to do so directly." The Origin and Growth of Religion, p. 240.

> ways for good or ill. In Melanesia "mana" is associated with "animism," i.e., with the belief that spirits is an explanatory afterthought, the most elementary religion being just the recognition of the supernatural as a vaguely conceived supernormal force before the rise of the belief in independent spirits--hence the title "pre-animistic" religion.[1]

It would seem that such convenient forms have little to recommend them, since human nature, as well as religion, has so many factors to contend with, that neither can be classified, nor averaged to be embraced within any formula.

If one must reduce the origin of religion to one given factor in human experience, the imagination makes it possible to attribute all beginnings of ideas of the supernatural to "Neurotism." Indeed, a good case might be made out for this as a theory of importance. Are not all men dissatisfied with their lot? As far as is known there are no neurotic animals in nature. When man evolved to the point of self-consciousness, unrest began, and he sought self expression. In so doing he attempted to inflict himself upon his fellows with evil effects. As a result, the oppressed sought relief from a sense of inferiority by day dreaming, which in turn leads to a belief in unknown supernatural power, and so on. This theory may be enlarged and illustrated from primitive neurotic shamans of the Siberian plains, or by illustrations from William James.

A recent police report comes from North Western Australia stating that an absent husband recently killed his wife by black magic. This psychological phenomena is common in

---

[1] Ibid., p. 55.

Polynesia. This hypothetical theory might also be illustrated from the lives of most great religious leaders past or present, pre-literate or erudite. One might even show that there was a mal-adjustment in the home-life of Jesus, for did it not take an angel to appease Joseph? Was there not some confusion in the lives of the bretheren of the Holy family? A twelve year old boy teaching philosophers does not appear normal. An inexplicable rebuke in public to a mother by a son is not usual.

Some of these dialectical discussions on the origin of religion seem to have a tendency to invite levity.

However we are indebted to, and must respect the efforts of reputable scholars in the field of Anthropology and Psychology for their contribution in the search for reality among primitive peoples. The chief function of such theories as have been mentioned in the preceding pages, it would seem, is to give a broader base for future studies. It is regretable that qualified theologians have neglected the importance of the theologies of simpler peoples, for they have much that is worth while to offer, as it is hoped may be shown in the following pages.

CHAPTER IV

THE IDEA OF THE NUMINOUS IN PRE-LITERATE RELIGIONS

There is one phase of primitive man's religious life that has been neglected by anthropologists, except perhaps by Dr. Marett, and that is pre-literate man's feeling for, and faith in, what Dr. Otto calls the "numinous."[1] It is definitely clear that these untutored peoples of the forest and plains have this sense of their natures as well developed as do literate peoples. This we hope to illustrate later by case histories.

According to Dr. Rudolf Otto, "Holiness--'the holy'--is a category of interpretation and valuation peculiar to the sphere of religion."[2]

Somewhere in the development of higher animals, it would seem, according to the general biological beliefs now current, that, the glandular and nervous system evolved to a point, where, reason became possible. In the case of man this mental development outstripped that of all other creatures. But the unique thing in man which is shared by no other living creature is man's receptivity to that "something"

---

[1] Rudolf Otto, The Idea of the Holy, (New York: The Macmillan Co., n.d.), p. 5.

[2] Ibid., p. 5

from without which is non-rational and which completely eludes apprehension in terms of concrete ideas. Many words in primitive languages have attempted to describe it, for instance "Mana" of the South Pacific Islands, "Kami" a Japanese term meaning, "distilled from the wonderful and sublime in nature," the Chinese "T'ien," the Supreme Spirit of Heaven"; in Dakota "nuja" is "breath" and "life." Similarly the western Australians use the word "Wang" for "breath" and "spirit." In Java the word "nawa" means "health," "life," "soul"; in the Yakima tribe of Oregon, "wkriska" means "mind," and"whrishuit","life." With the Aztecs "chacatl" expressed "air" and "soul."[1] It is noticeable that one of the nearest concrete ideas used by the pre-literate peoples to express the abstract, as it deals with the Supernatural is, "wind." As Edward Clodd says,

> This identity of wind with breath, breath with spirits, and hence Spirits with the Great Spirits of the barbaric religions, has further illustrations in the legends of the Quiches, in which the creative power is "Hurakan," whence the word hurricane: and in the New Testament, where the advent of the Holy Spirit is described, "as of the rushing of mighty wind!"

In the Mohawk language, "atonritz," "the soul," is from "atonrion" "to breathe," while "spirit" comes from "spiro" "to breathe." "Animus" the "mind," is cognate with "anima," "air" or "breathe"; and in Irish, we have "anal," "breathe" and "anan," "life" or "soul." In Sanskrit, we find an "to blow" or "breathe" whence anila "wind"; in Greek anemos has

---

[1] Clodd, op. cit., p. 37

the same meaning. Psyche, pneuma, and thymos, each meaning "soul" or "spirit" are also from roots expressing "wind" or "breath." In Slavonic the root du has developed the meaning of "breath" into that of "spirit," and Gypsy dialect has duk, which is "breath" or "ghost." Ghost, the German geist, and the Dutch geest, are each derived from a root seen in Icelandic geisa, meaning "to rage" as fire and wind. In the non-aryan Finnish, far, means "soul" and "breath"; the Hebrew nephesh, ruach and neshamah pass from the meaning "breath" to "spirit." The like applies to the Egyptian Kreph. These names cover the world-wide conception of spirit as ethereal.[1] Although these illustrations have been used as proof of the existence of the idea of the soul in connection with animism, nevertheless, they also show us that barbaric people were conscious of "something" other that enters into the life of man. In attempting to describe this numinous quality, it appears that primitive man is no more successful than ourselves. This sense of an unknown power must be felt. Although common to all men it is more developed in some persons than in others, and is not an inchoate stirring of the feelings. I am inclined to believe that among the simpler living peoples, the proportion of true mystics is greater than among the more sophisticated peoples of western civilization, notwithstanding the popular idea to the contrary. This atunement with the infinite also manifests itself in the appre-

---

[1]Clodd, Ibid., p. 36 ff.

ciation of the beautiful by primitives. Let it be observed that nearly all pre-literate peoples have an art and a verbal literature, and an appreciation of the beauties of nature. It is also the basis of human love, a thing also highly developed among primitive peoples. This unique feeling-response to the holy, is primarily an individual and personal thing.

These concepts will now be illustrated by case histories.

CHAPTER V

CASE HISTORIES

Cases of Conversion Showing the Integration of Personality which Resulted from Mystical Experiences

The following case histories, or episodes, taken from pre-literate peoples' religious testimonies, and compared with somewhat similar experiences of Christian persons, illustrate that the simpler people can, and do respond to the "numinous," and that they subscribe to the basic forms of human morality, such as: social loyalty, justice, love, human sympathy, and integrity.

We herewith present a case history of an American Indian compared with that of a civilized person.

The point of this is, both had mystical experiences, a faith in, and a dependence on, the "Great Unknown Father," a sense of sin, and an appreciation of the moral quality of social loyalty.

Case History of Red-Shirt Jim.--Dr. Lowie gives us the story of an Indian of the Lemhi Shoshone tribe of Idaho as follows:

As a result of an individual experience, Red-shirt Jim had somewhat unusual ideas about the soul and the hereafter. In about 1890 he fell sick from breaking a food taboo. He dreamt about a great war and was suddenly struck by a hailstone. His condition became serious, and a separate lodge was built for him to die in.

"I was still breathing. I thought of seeing my dead father and mother, brother and relatives. I wished to die immediately. For three days and four nights I lay in my tent. At last on the fourth day my soul (mɯ ' gua) came out of my thigh, made a step forward and glanced back at my body. The mɯ'gua was about as large as this (ten inches). My body was not yet life-less. When the mɯ'gua had made three steps forward, my body dropped, cold and dead. I looked at it for some time; it made no movement at all.

"Suddenly something came down and went through my soul. My soul began to go downward. It did not ascend. I reached another world and followed a trail there. I beheld a helper of the Father who was making some dead men over again. I thought I might see the Father, but could only hear him. He was saying to me, 'You don't look ill.' A kind of thin wire was making a noise at the time. The Father had a buckskin bag; out of its contents he makes everything. He tapped the wire three times. Then I was able to see his hand, which was as small and clean as a baby's. Then the whole world opened up and I could see the earth plainly.

"I saw everything there. I saw my own body lying there. I saw my own body lying there dead.

"The Sun told me I would be restored to life. I did not walk back and I don't know how I returned. Suddenly I was back alive. For a few minutes, I had seen the Father. He was a handsome Indian."[1]

If we analyze this man's religious experience, defining religion as James does, as "the feelings, acts, and experiences of individual men in their solitude, so far as they apprehend themselves to stand in relation to whatever they may consider divine,"[2] we find that our pre-literate subject

---

[1]Lowie, op. cit., p. 101. [2]James, op. cit., p. 31

was a decidedly mystical person, recognizing the non-material or spiritual, the possibility of a non-corporeal existence. He had a distinct sense of the reality of the unseen.

It is not our intent to read Christian beliefs into this episode; nevertheless, we cannot but note certain remarkable similarities to Christian concepts. This Indian experienced a kind of conversion. There was a descent into another world. There is a helping, loving father and creator, an awe of the supernatural, ceremonialism, a feeling of transcendence. There is a sense of a place beyond, a resurrection and a rationalization of the Indian's vision. On the moral side, he seems to have reacted to the idea of purity, charity, love, hope, and faith.

It is customary among many of the writers on primitive people to depreciate or laugh at the simple religious beliefs of their less sophisticated brethren. After all, have we not records of persons reared under the influence of the Christian religion who have held outlandish views on spiritual matters, not far in advance of those of untutored peoples? And why should not the primitive human, as well as his literate brother, have a vision of the supernatural? Is there any great difference between the experience of the Indian just noted and that of the German idealist, Malwida von Meysenbug, as recorded by James, as follows:

Case History of Malwida von Meysenbug.--

> "I was alone upon the seashore as all these thoughts flowed over me, liberating and reconciling; and now again, as once before in distant days in the Alps of Dauphine, I was impelled to kneel down, this time before

> the illimitable ocean, symbol of the Infinite. I felt that I prayed as I had never prayed before, and knew now what prayer really is: to return from the solitude of individuation into the consciousness of unity with all that is, to kneel down as one that passes away, and to rise up as one imperishable. Earth, heaven, and sea resounded as in one vast world-encircling harmony. It was as if the chorus of all the great who had ever lived were about me. I felt myself one with them, and it appeared as if I heard their greeting: 'Thou too belongest to the company of those who overcome.'"[1]

Although Dr. Lowie, following Dr. Tylor, lists this account under the heading of animism,[2] meaning the belief in spiritual beings, it would seem more specific to describe it as a state of feeling which has an insight into forces unknown to reason, which belongs to the realm of the non-rational. This experience, as such, is very real to the Indian, especially if we consider it as a result of his moral, practical, religious, and emotional reactions working to produce a mystical state. In this state, the warrior found a new meaning in words and points of view which had hitherto been empty though familiar possessions.[3] No doubt his vision helped psychologically to restore his self-confidence which had been undermined by the breaking of the taboo. Such experiences are common enough in Christian, Mohammedan, and other Oriental religions, although in this case we must recognize

---

[1] James, op. cit., p. 395.

See appendix for further example of a Christian Mystical Experience.

[2] Lowie, op. cit., p. 99.

[3] W. E. Hocking, The Meaning of God in Human Experience, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1912), p. 425. A paraphrase of James' definition of a mystic.

that the vision was part of the cultural complex[1] of the tribe of the particular Indian.

As. W. P. Paterson says,

> It is no doubt difficult to discover the individual in the state of nature. The factors which make up his congenital endowment for religion are inseparably blended with the educative influence by which he has been served, heir to the religious ideas and practices that are current in the society to which he owes birth and nurture.[2]

It is very true that the savage is likewise the product of tradition and custom, and that his scheme of religious thought and practices is often artificial to a high degree. Nevertheless, he is a religiously endowed person, and as such we shall study him, however futile it may be to speculate on the original religious inspiration of man.

To seek the source of the religious experience is not within the province of this paper. Various writers explain it in various ways, giving fear, awe, and reverence as motivating factors. Schleiemacher writes; "The common element in all pious states, and consequently the essence of piety, is that we feel ourselves absolutely dependent, to wit, dependent on God."[3]

Returning to our Indian it would seem that his experience, allowing for the fact that he is following his tribal

---

[1]Clark Wissler, Man and Culture, (New York: Thomas V. Crowell and Co., 1923), p.2., defines cultural complex in the anthropological sense, and it is so used in this paper.

[2]W. P. Paterson, The Nature of Religion, (New York: George A. Doran Co., 1924), p. 38.

[3]Lowie, op. cit., quoting Schleiemacher, Der Christliche Glaube, p. 33.

religious milieu of a belief in visions, seems to have in some sense the "numinous" view point of Professor Otto.[1] He experiences a sense of dependence on something other than himself, and his own insignificance. He has a mysterious feeling of something "Other" entering and impressing him. He has been drawn to God by hope, duty, love, and perhaps by unknown holier ties that he realizes not. He is a convert, who has responded to the promises and decrees of his own religion, in other words, who has had a visionary experience. His life will now be modified in the interest of his own selfhood and in his relationship to his fellow tribesmen. Indirectly he will have attained a social status. God has blessed him. Compare this story with that of Jacob wrestling with God (Gen. XXXII v. 24 ff.) which will be discussed later. As with Jacob, the Indian was enlightened, emancipated and regenerated by God. He had faith and was saved; consequently his self-confidence was restored and he was able once more to walk in comradship with his fellows.

Independent of these personal reactions, we see that the cultural pattern of his religion has an eschatological context. The Indian followed the trail in another world, a world which he could only imagine according to his way of living in his tribal life. The Father acted as would a fellow Shoshone compatriot. A remarkable feature of the religious concept is the idea of the fatherhood of God, a thing which is not altogether rare in primitive peoples,[2] as shown

---

[1] Otto, op.cit., p.140.
[2] Lang, The Making of Religion, p. 193 ff.

by Andrew Lang and others. He was seen at first, through the spiritualized, pure and holy "hand," then completely in the idealized form of a handsome Indian. Just how much of this vision has stamped upon it borrowed Christian influence, is not indicated by the recorder of the episode. However, aside from such a possibility, the Shoshone had what was for him a distinct personal religious revelation. For him it was a real experience, and that is the chief consideration. The medium through which he worked, the tribal or foreign influence is not the most important thing. Without begging the question, we have here a true worshipper of the unknown, with an experience similar to that of worshippers of higher religions.

Quoting from Dr. Lowie,[1]

> a soul that is washed, and a soul that is ten inches high does not correspond to our ideas of spirituality, yet it is obvious that the Shoshoni conceived it as a distinct form and of finer essence than the human body.

If we consider the influence of the Indian's experience upon his fellow tribesmen, it must be evident that there are variable factors which cause changes in religious thought. Otherwise there would be no development. The individual is not completely merged in his social milieu, as Lowie puts it,[2] but he reacts to it as an individual, that is, differently from every other group member. The cultural tradition of his people dominates him, but it is reflected in a distinc-

---

[1] Lowie, op. cit., p. 102.

[2] Ibid., p. 221.

tive fashion in each psyche. One must study the person from both the individual psychological angle and from reference to the social norm. The pattern of the religious customs is socially determined, as has already been indicated, but no social power is able to completely regulate the individual's religious viewpoint. That is determined by his physiological make-up and by his personal reaction to his social milieu. Therefore, all persons have a potential personal contact with the divine, and it is at this point that the differences in personal religious reactions occur.

In the case of the Shoshone subject of our discussion, the religious custom of his tribe demands that before any warrior undertake an exploit of any kind, he must have a vision. This is accomplished by fasting and by mutilating the body. The fast no doubt brings about hallucinations. Nevertheless, the savage has by faith received something from the "numinous" world that is of distinct advantage to him. His illogical, untutored mind had received a "spiritual blessing." Henceforth he is a new man, and is so accepted by the tribe. He becomes a man of importance from whom is expected leadership, that is, if his vision passes the test set by tribal standards. In some tribes, notably the Winnebago,[1] the recipient of the vision must undergo a rigid examination by various of the elders. If not accepted, he must try again for another vision. If successful, he is in a posi-

---

[1]Paul Radin, Crashing Thunder, (New York: Appleton and Co., 1926), p. 82.

tion to influence his fellow religionists. As a respected person he is listened to, his name is borrowed to bestow upon children, his habits and ideas are copied. The ego of the individual finds satisfaction and within the limits of his tribal customs he modifies religious thought. If he is a man of somewhat finer personality and sensibilities, there is a possibility that his thought and ideas will continue long after he has been forgotten.

Above all, our Indian is religious in his own right and responds to the "Eternal unknown power" even as we do.

The Case History of a Winnebago Indian, Thunder Cloud.--

> How poor, how rich, how abject, how august,
> How complicate, how wonderful, is man!
> How passing wonder He who makes him such!
> Who centred in our make such strange extremes!
> From different natures marvellously mix'd,
> Connexion exquisite of distant worlds!
> Distinguish'd link in being's endless chain!
> Midway from nothing to the Deity!
> A beam ethereal, sullied and absorb'd!
> Though sullied and dishonour'd still divine!
> Dim miniature of greatness absolute!
> An heir of glory![1]

The following episodes show a primitive man's nature "marvellously mix'd"and difficult to disentangle. They embody intensely individual experiences and as such are at variance with the viewpoint of certain writers that the savage is an almost unqualified product of tradition and custom.[2]

---

[1]Edward Young, Night Thoughts, (Boston: Cosby, Nichols, Lee and Co., 1860), p. 38.

[2]Paterson, The Nature of Religion, p. 38.

They give the story of a Winnebago Indian[1] who could not conform to the tribal tradition, try as he would, of the later psychological difficulties this engendered, and how he at last became converted to another Indian religion. This story is taken from Radin's Autobiography of "Crashing Thunder" a Winnebago Indian living in Northeast Nebraska twenty-five miles from Sioux City, Iowa.

Crashing Thunder, a Winnebago Indian, relates in his autobiography a story told to him by his brøther-in-law, a shaman[2] of the tribe. He tells it to illustrate the type of vision, which, according to the tribal pattern he was expected to have, but did not. Crashing Thunder underwent the fasting ordeal of an adolescent Indian boy.[3] He remained all the night in a specially prepared lodge, far distant from the camp. On the first night he received no vision. The next day his father came and instructed him in tribal lore in order to aid the advent of the hoped for vision. Three days and nights this procedure was repeated, but still no vision came. On the eve of the fourth night, the hungry boy, anxious to

---

[1]James L. Leyburn, op. cit., "Winnebago." A tribe of the Oke Siouan linguistic family, originating in Wisconsin near Lake Winnebago, p. 266.

[2]Kroeber, op. cit., p. 363. "Shaman (Pl.Shamans) is an individual without official authority but often of great personal influence. His supposed power comes to him directly from the Spirits as a grant or gift."

Of Siberian origin, in American Ethnology the term is equivalent to medicine-man.

[3]Each Winnebago Indian at the time of puberty was taught to fast and remain away from camp in a distant wood for several nights. During this time each boy was expected to get a vision. Some did. Many did not.

partake of the feast prepared for the initiates, returned to camp. He lied to his elders, saying that he had been blessed by a vision. This inability to receive a vision bothered him until middle age when he was finally converted to another religion, and in this other cult received a vision.

The following is the tale of his brother-in-law's spiritual experiences.

> My brother-in-law was named Thunder Cloud.[1] It is said that he was living his third life as a human being.[5]
>
> This is his account:
>
> I once lived with a small group of Indians numbering about twenty camps. When I had grown up to be a lad, although still not large enough to handle a gun, a war-party attacked us and killed us all. I did not know, however, that I had been killed. I thought that I was running about as usual until I saw a heap of bodies on the ground and mine among them. No one was there to bury us, so there we lay and rotted.
>
> My ghost was taken to the place where the sun sets. There I lived with an old couple. The land of the spirits is an excellent place and the people have the best of times. If you desire to go anywhere all that you have to do is to wish yourself there and you reach it. While there I thought I would like to come to the earth again so the old man with whom I was staying said to me, "My son, did you not speak about wanting to go to the earth again?" I had as a matter of fact only thought of it yet he knew what I wanted. Then he said to me, "You can go but you must ask our chief first." Then I went and told the chief of the village of my desire, and he said to me, "You may go and obtain your revenge upon the people who killed your relatives."

---

[1] Radin, Crashing Thunder, p. 5 f.

[5] Footnote 5 by Radin.
"The belief in reincarnation is very widespread among the Winnebago. It is generally believed that if any child resembles some deceased individual he is that individual reincarnated. Not every person, however, can become reincarnated. This is a privilege that belongs only to the more prominent people and to the members of the most sacred of Winnebago ceremonies, the Medicine Dance."

Then I was brought down to earth. I did not enter a woman's womb but I was taken into a room. There I remained conscious at all times. One day I heard the noise of little children so I thought I would go outside. Then it seemed to me that I was going through a door but I was really being born again from a woman's womb.....

Thence I came to this earth for the third time and here I am. I am going through the same that I knew before.

Thus my brother-in-law had lived long ago, had joined the Medicine Dance [6] and adhered strictly to its precepts. He was a good man; he disliked no one; he never stole and never did he fight. He made offerings of tobacco to the spirits and was always giving feasts. He could always be relied upon.

When Thunder Cloud was in spirit land, just before he was to come to this earth, he fasted. He only ate once a month. All the different spirits who live on high, all those who live under the earth, indeed all those whom Earthmaker had created, they all blessed him. Then he came to the earth and was born here as a human being again. When he came to earth he fasted. All the various spirits who had blessed him before, now blessed him again. Thus did he become a holy man. When he came here, he became a shaman for he was very holy. Indeed he was the North spirit.

Once when I was sick he treated me. As soon as he came my father arose with tobacco in his hands and made him an offering, greeting him as follows:

"My son-in-law, tobacco do I offer you and I make offerings to your spirits. You have made your hat [7] become holy, for the various spirits made it sacred. I greet you."

Footnotes 5-6-7 by Radin.

[6] "The Medicine Dance is a secret society which with the preliminary ceremonies lasts five days. Members of this society are supposed to possess the secret of being able to kill one another and then to restore one another to life again. The 'killing' is done by 'shooting' a shell from a pouch made out of an otter skin. The shell is supposed to enter the body of the person shot at and to render him unconscious. He regains consciousness gradually after spitting out the shell."

The ceremony is described in detail on pp. 103 ff.of this autobiography. P. Radin, op. cit., p. 103 ff.

[7] "Symbolical expression for the various objects and blessings bestowed upon him by the spirits."

Let us ignore the bizarre episodes of Thunder Cloud's story, for after all this was but the medium through which he received his vision.[1] Instead let us consider its religious aspects as they bore upon his own life. Let us consider it as far as possible as the specific feeling of the individual irrespective of his tribal beliefs, customs or conceptions, for after all, these are not in themselves religious, but adjuncts to religious feeling, however they may color it.

This pre-literate individual believed in spirits more powerful than himself, who controlled the important values of life as he saw and felt them. To him, the vision was real. The place of the setting sun was his conception of heaven. It was peopled with happy humans and good spirits, governed by a "Great Chief" to whom Thunder Cloud gave allegiance. The hero of our story worshipped obediently and reverently this benevolent creator, "Earthmaker," who blessed and watched over his subjects, as did the spirits also.

Apparently the moral code of the tribe was part of their religious beliefs. The hope seemed to be to attain association with these other-world, incorporeal beings, in order to become holy and sacred, as they were. To this end, offerings were made, and a good life lived. Certain parallels to Christianity present themselves, viz:-- a benevolent, fatherly creator; man, as a worshipful, reverent, obedient,

---

[1]This vision is but one of a kind peculiar to certain North American Indians. For further examples of this type of vision see Paul Radin's"Religion of North American Indians," Journal of American Folk-Lore, Vol. XXVII, No. CVI. p. 364.

and respectful being; a sense of the holy, the sacred and the good; a heaven filled with guardian spirits; and a developed type of worship, sacrifice, and ceremony. In addition, there is a high moral code, with a sense of truth, justice, love, hope, faith, and charity, and a value placed upon persons. The one jarring note is in the law of blood revenge for personal injury, which, incidentally, sounds not unlike certain Biblical accounts of early Semitic peoples in the Palestinian desert, who then believed in the principle of "an eye for an eye, a tooth for a tooth."[1]

This strange assortment of life-values was precious to Thunder Cloud. Through his vision, which was a part of his devotional practice, he hoped to orientate himself to the worth while things of life as he conceived them. This self-induced type of vision is somewhat equivalent to a solitary prayer in which the person is permitted to freely express to a supernatural being, his hopes and desires. Although the form of the vision is determined by tribal custom, the content is strictly personal for each member of this tribe. In this respect these Winnebago people differ from ancient Hebrews to whom the individual was of secondary importance in the tribal group. It was not until the days of the prophet Jeremiah that the importance of the individual worshipper was recognized.[2]

---

[1]See the stories of "Absalom and his half-sister, Tamar, II Samuel, 13:1 ff. and of the "Abuse of the Levite's concubine in Gibeah," Judges 10.

[2]Jeremiah, Ch. 31: 29-34.

A further case of integration of personality. In the following story we have an example of integration of a personality through religious experience. This individual also had a strong sense of morality, of a sort, which included sympathy for an abused brother and an attempt at crude justice, as well as a sense of "The Holy."

Case History of Crashing Thunder.--Before attempting to further analyze the conventionalized religious experience of the Winnebago Indian "Thunder Cloud," we will give an account of the conversion of Crashing Thunder into the Peyote Cult.[1] Then we shall compare the two types of religious experiences of these children of the prairie with similar experiences of persons belonging to our more sophisticated Christian cults.

According to Dr. Radin,[2]

> Crashing Thunder was a remarkable man in his own community. His life was a succession of climaxes and anticlimaxes. He began life with a lie and it was rounded by murder and a conversion. Much of it was spent in sexual debauch and in drunkenness. Pleasures and intense suffering were also his. His favorite brother was killed, murdered. He longs for revenge and in despair desires death. . . . .He gets delirium tremens and shares with Burns the rare good fortune of seeing ghosts drunk. . . . .He becomes a poet. . . . . Subsequently, at his conversion, he sees God, identifies himself with God, with the soul and with thought itself.

I am Converted

> On one occasion we were to have a meeting of men and women and I went to it with a woman, the one with whom I thought I would go around the next day. That was the only reason I went with her. When we arrived at the meeting, the leader asked me to sit near him and there

---

[1] See Appendix; Peyote Worship.

[2] Radin, Crashing Thunder, p. xviii.

I was placed. He urged me to eat many peyote and I did so. Now the leaders of the ceremony always place the sacred objects in front of themselves. The sacred peyote was also placed there. Now the one this particular leader placed in front of himself this time was a very small one. "Why does he have a very small one?" I thought to myself. However, I did not think of this matter long.

It was now late at night. I had eaten a lot of peyote and felt rather tired. I suffered considerably. After a while I looked at the peyote, and there I saw an eagle standing with outspread wings. It was as beautiful a sight as could well be observed. Each of the feathers seemed to have a mark. The eagle stood there looking at me. I turned my gaze, thinking that perhaps there was something the matter with my sight, but then when I looked again the eagle was still present. Again I turned around and when I looked at the spot where the eagle had stood, it was gone and only the small peyote remained. I then watched the other people, but they all had their heads bowed and were praying.

Suddenly I saw a lion lying in the same place where before I had seen the eagle. I watched it very closely and when I turned my eyes for the least little bit, it disappeared. "I suppose all those present are aware of this and I am just beginning to find out," I thought. Then I saw a small person at the same place. He wore blue clothes and a shining brimmed cap. He had on a soldier's uniform and was sitting on the arm of the person who was drumming, scrutinizing everybody. He was a little man but perfect in all proportions. Finally I lost sight of him. I was very much surprised indeed. I sat very quietly. "So this is what it is," I thought. "This is what they all probably see and which I am just now beginning to find out."

Then I prayed to Earthmaker, to God: "<u>This is your ceremony let me hereafter perform.</u>"[1]

As a result of indulgence in the sacred peyote Crashing Thunder has been released from internal psychological tensions. Suddenly he gets religious insight, which, apparently he had been striving for, over a long period of time. He relates in his story that he had tried to resist eating the peyote. In due time he yields to the importunities of some of his friends, members of the cult. At first he only

---

[1] Italics mine.

received the usual visual chromatic[1] hallucinations which the infusion of this species of cactus causes when taken into the stomach. Later he entered into fellowship with the peyote cultists. On one of these occasions his conversion occurs.[2] Again, the story matters little. Similar incidents, as related above, might easily be duplicated among civilized people when under the influence of narcotics, when dreaming or when suffering from mental shock or stress. The significant thing is that he experienced religion. His divided, striving self becomes united, and at peace.

In the ordinary daily course of this Indian's life the conditioned "Ego" was dominant, and restless. The new experience took him out of his habitual selfhood, and threw him into another sphere, in which he had not had time to build up resistances. At this point the striving, innate spirit was able to operate. His whole life fell apart. He saw his conflicts dissolved; the peripheral thoughts of a lifetime came to the center of his understanding. To his credit he yielded his old life and self to a new authority outside of himself. He entered a wider spiritual life and took the first step to an integrated life. How remarkably Christian like is his undoctrinated prayer. Compare: "Thy will be done," with "This is your ceremony, let me hereafter perform." This type of experience would seem to me to fit any orthodox definition of conversion.

---

[1] Lowie, op. cit., p. 200, quoting A. L. Kroeber.

[2] Radin, Journal of Religious Psychology, Vol.7..No.1,p.20.

On another similar occasion Crashing Thunder had another revelation, which supplements the above story, and illustrates how his personality was further integrated and strengthened by new religious experiences.

The story is as follows:

I See God.

As I looked again I saw a flag. I looked more carefully and I saw the house full of flags. They had the most beautiful marks on them. In the middle of the room there was a large flag, a living one. It was moving. In the doorway there was another one not entirely visible. I had never seen anything so beautiful in all my life before.

Again I prayed to God. I bowed my head and closed my eyes and began to speak. I said many things that I would ordinarily never have spoken about. As I prayed I was aware of something above me and there He was, He to whom I was speaking, God. That which we call the soul, that it is which is God. This is what I felt and saw. The one called Earthmaker, God, is a spirit and He it was I felt and saw. At least this is what I learned. I instantly became their spirit; I was their spirit or soul. Whatever they thought of I immediately knew. I did not have to speak to them and get an answer to know what their thoughts were. Then I thought of a certain place far away, and immediately I was there. It was my thought.[1]

I looked about and watched the people around me and then when I opened my eyes I was myself in body again. From now on thus it shall be, I felt. This is the way they are and I am only now beginning to find out. "All those who heed God must be thus. I shall not need any more food for am I not my spirit? I shall have no more use of my body; my corporeal affairs are over." Thus I felt.

Then all stopped and left the lodge, for it had begun to dawn. Some one spoke to me. I did not answer, for I thought they were just fooling and that they were like myself, that therefore it would be unnecessary for me to speak to them. So instead of speaking I answered with a smile. "They are just saying this to me because they realize that I have only now found out," I thought that was why I didn't answer. I did not speak to any one until noon. Then I had to leave the house to urinate and

---

[1] Probably a subconscious reference to his childhood experience when attempting to get a vision.

some one followed me. It was my friend. He said, "My friend, what troubles you that makes you act as you do?" "Well, there's no need of your saying anything, for you know it before hand," I said.[1]

It might be observed at this point that one can worship his God in some cult or religion other than his own. In this case, Crashing Thunder worshipped in one of the subcults of the Peyote religious complex, which had its origin among the native peoples of Mexico. From thence it was introduced into the Arapaho tribes of the Southwest. It was carried to the Winnebago peoples by one of their members, an Indian named John Rave. Later, elements of Christianity were added by Albert Henley, a Carlisle graduate. Still later, Jesse Clay of the Arapahos caused a schism by re-introducing further elements of the Arapaho form of the Peyote cult, modified by more Christian influences. Thus we have an excellent example of the way in which religions may be synthesized.[2]

The sense of the "Holy" seems to be residual in some men to a lesser degree than in others. For such to receive a sudden conversion would require a very strong stimulation. This does not seem to have been the case with Crashing Thunder. He was, even in his childhood, a seeker of God. Part of this was no doubt the result of tribal and family influence, but judging from his story it was the synthetic process of a life time. It reached its culmination after his conversion. With

---

[1] Radin, Crashing Thunder, p. 190 f.

[2] Lowie, op. cit., p. 200.

all the mysticism of his personal and racial inheritance, he saw God. What emerged as a result of this social and personal interaction, and transformation, was a supernaturalism. From now on, according to his story, his vital, strenuous, boisterous life is organized. This is the culmination of the experience he failed to get as a child. The sense of restlessness, futility, uncertainty, the fear of inhibitions are at an end. He now integrates his life along progressive lines, in terms of God. This seems to be the main purpose of religion. According to his story, he marries, for love, and has a family.

As Radin says:[1]

> When he finally got the experience he had been seeking, although it had come to him in the most devious and unexpected manner, he recognized it at once, was satisfied, and became a good man, even from the normal Christian standpoint.

Let us compare the above stories with a somewhat similar Christian conversion.

Case History of an Oxford Graduate.--

A Christian Conversion[2]

> "I was converted in my own bedroom in my father's rectory house at precisely three o'clock in the afternoon of a hot July day (July 13, 1886). I was in perfect health, having been off from the drink for nearly a month. I was in no way troubled about my soul. In fact, God was not in my thoughts that day. A young lady friend sent me a copy of Professor Drummond's Natural Law in the Spiritual World, asking me my opinion of it as a literary work only. Being proud of my critical talents and wishing to enhance myself in my new friend's esteem, I took the book to my bedroom for quiet, intending to give it a thorough study, and then write her what I thought of it. It was here that

---

[1] Radin, Crashing Thunder, p. xx.

[2] James, op. cit., p. 221.

God met me face to face, and I shall never forget the meeting. 'He that hath the Son hath life eternal; he that hath not the Son hath not life.' I had read this scores of times before, but this made all the difference. I was now in God's presence and my attention was absolutely 'soldered' on to this verse, and I was not allowed to proceed with the book till I had fairly considered what these words really involved. Only then was I allowed to proceed, feeling all the while that there was another being in my bedroom, though not seen by me. The stillness was very marvelous, and I felt supremely happy. It was most unquestionably shown me, in one second of time, that I had never touched the Eternal; and that if I died then, I must inevitably be lost. I was undone. I knew it as well as I now know I am saved. The Spirit of God showed it me in ineffable love; there was no terror in it; I felt God's love so powerfully upon me that only a mighty sorrow crept over me that I had lost all through my own folly; and what was I to do? What could I do? I did not repent even; God never asked me to repent. All the time I was supremely happy: I felt like a child before his father. I had done wrong, but my Father did not scold me, but loved me most wondrously. Still my doom was sealed. I was lost to a certainty, and being naturally of a brave disposition I did not quail under it, but deep sorrow for the past, mixed with regret for what I had lost, took hold upon me, and my soul thrilled within me to think it was all over. Then there crept in upon me so gently, so lovingly, so unmistakably, a way of escape, and what was it after all? The old, old story over again, told in the simplest way: 'There is no name under heaven whereby ye can be saved except that of the Lord Jesus Christ.' No words were spoken to me; my soul seemed to see my Saviour in the spirit, and from that hour to this, nearly nine years now, there has never been in my life one doubt that the Lord Jesus Christ and God the Father both worked upon me that afternoon in July, both differently, and both in the most perfect love conceivable, and I rejoiced there and then in a conversion so astounding that the whole village heard of it in less than twenty-four hours.

"But a time of trouble was yet to come. The day after my conversion I went into the hay-field to lend a hand with the harvest, and not having made any promise to God to abstain or drink in moderation only, I took too much and came home drunk. My poor sister was heart-broken; and I felt ashamed of myself and got to my bedroom at once, where she followed me, weeping copiously. She said I had been converted and fallen away instantly. But although I was quite full of drink (not muddled, however), I knew that God's work begun in me was not going to be wasted. About midday I made on my knees the first prayer before God for twenty years. I did not ask to be forgiven; I felt that was no good, for I would be sure to fall

> again. Well, what did I do? I committed myself to him in the profoundest belief that my individuality was going to be destroyed, that he would take all from me, and I was willing. In such a surrender lies the secret of a holy life. From that hour drink has had no terrors for me: I never touch it, never want it. The same thing occurred with my pipe: after being a regular smoker from my twelfth year the desire for it went at once, and has never returned. So with every known sin, the deliverance in each case being permanent and complete. I have had no temptation since conversion, God seemingly having shut out Satan from that course with me. He gets a free hand in other ways, but never on sins of the flesh. Since I gave up to God all ownership in my own life, he has guided me in a thousand ways, and has opened my path in a way almost incredible to those who do not enjoy the blessing of a truly surrendered life."

In reading these two stories through in succession, one is impressed by the divergences in the characters of these two men. The Indian, Crashing Thunder, is a strong, brave, and vital man; one who has lived life in its fulness, if not well. The other, according to Professor Leuba, was an Oxford graduate, son of a clergyman. This man gives one the impression of weakness and irresoluteness.

The primitive man sought God all his life. The latter says that he never darkened the door of his father's church from the time he graduated from Oxford until he was thirty-three years of age. The first takes his experience in his stride, with no confession of sin, or as Radin expresses it; "his final conversion and spiritual and moral regeneration are consequently to him neither reaction against vices nor the ending of a long continued unward search." It is just an incident happening to come at last.[1] The second man is hardly an heroic character. The child of nature never doubted God,

---

[1] Radin, Crashing Thunder, p. xxi.

nor became a cynic. Psychologically speaking, he seems to have been angry with himself in not being able to get a vision of God. When he did get his vision, he accepted it, and went calmly about his way. The sophisticated English gentleman, although apparently conscious of a "Higher Influence" was suffering from a sense of inferiority, regretfulness, remorsefulness, and after his conversion lapsed for a time again into drunkenness.

Both were childhood products of religiously minded fathers. Both men were apparently natively well endowed with a sense of the holy. The well meaning parental thwartings, set up within the young men strong conflicts, which when released, yielded spectacular conversions in advanced adulthood.

The significant thing is that these several savage civilized people namely; Red Shirt the Shoshonean, Thunder Cloud and Crashing Thunder the Winnebagoeans, Malwida von Meysembug the German lady, and the unnamed Oxford graduate, responded to a supra-natural non-rational influence, which may be termed religious. Three of them saw the "Earthmaker," the other two, the "Creator." They were aware of the same forces in spite of their different cultural settings.

In studying these several persons, both savage and civilized, it would appear, as a result of their respective religious experiences, they have, to a greater or lesser extent, become integrated personalities.

Each has organized his personality about a set of values, which to him, or her, are signally important. One may call this conversion for want of better term, but the essence of the matter is, each has received a sense of inward peace. Furthermore, since man can neither live alone nor experience religion outside the society of his social group, it would appear that, these persons whom we are discussing, as a result of their religious experiences, also became more perfectly integrated socially.

Cases Illustrating Fear and Awe as Part of the Religious Experience

Case History of Katek, the Chukchee.--We now offer another type of religious experience. Often it has been said that fear is the basis of all religion. The feeling of awe and likewise fear, have their place in the religions of all men, as deep seated as the desire to live. Religious awe is a human product, fear, on the other hand, is a feeling shared by other creatures. Fear may imply awe as in the phrase "Fear of God," but nevertheless it has not quite the same numinous quality as awe. The histories of primitive peoples reveal that they were well aware of the importance of these psychological phenomena in their religious lives. The old psalmist sang "The fear of Jehovah is clean, enduring for ever.[1] The several nature psalms are filled with such phrases,

---

[1] Ps. 19; 9.

illustrating the innate religious sense of awe. The following story from Siberia shows how awe and fear work among preliterate man. The incident is recorded by W. Bogoras.[1]

> Still another acquaintance of mine, by the name of Katek, from the village of Unisak at Indian Point entered into relation with the spirits when he was of mature age, during a terrible adventure he had while hunting seal. While making the ice-floe, along a wide crack, he happened to harpoon a seal, which came out of the water at some distance from the edge of the ice. With the ice-pick on the butt of his harpoon, he took off a piece of ice large enough to support his body, and ventured on it out toward the seal, using the heft of his harpoon as a paddle; maritime hunters, lacking a canoe, often do the same. Meanwhile a strong gale came from the land and carried away the ice-floe. Seeing his danger, he wound the line around his waist, and fastened its end to the point of his ice-pick, in front and behind. Then he drove the harpoon firmly into the ice, and clutched it with both hands, trying to stand his ground against the sea. The sea was rough, the waves rolled over his head, and he was thoroughly drenched. After several hours of such suffering, Katek rebelled against his fate, and he was about to end the ordeal by stabbing himself with his belt-knife, when a large walrus head suddenly popped out of the water quite close to him and sang, "O Katek, do not kill yourself! You shall again see the mountains of Kuwakak, your elder son." Then quite unexpectedly, Katek saw a large iceberg, which drew the block on which he stood toward itself. Most icebergs are quite steep and inaccessible, but on this one he found a gentle slope where he could easily land. He took his harpoon along, and hauling in the line, found the harpoon point still lost in the seal-carcass. After that he climbed the iceberg, and finding a suitable place, constructed a temporary shelter of the blocks of rough ice lying about. Then he skinned the seal, and creeping under the shelter, spread the skin for a floor covering, and crouching down, took off his clothes piece by piece, carefully wringing out the water, and scraping it off with his knife. He ate the seal-blubber, and swallowed a few pieces of ice which tasted like fresh water. Then the wind changed and the iceberg drifted to land. At last after twenty-four hours spent on the water, he came to land near the village of Cecin. When he reached his own village, he found his family already bringing sacrifice of seal-oil to his Manes. He bade them direct the sacrifice to the walrus-head, and from that time on he was a Shaman.

---

[1] W.Bogoras,"The Chuckchee Religion,"Memoirs of the American Museum of Natural History, Vol.XI,Part II. Reprint from Vol.III, Part II of the publication of the Jessup North Pacific

It might do well at this point to consider a similar, if not exactly parallel incident of mystical revelation as recorded in Genesis,[1] of "Jacob's wrestling," as an influence of awe.

The old story so closely bound up with primitive Yahwe cultism tells us that the antagonist was anxious to depart at the break of day, and that Jacob was unwilling to let him go. Jacob wrestled to win a blessing from his divine antagonist. In this strange contest, beside the river bank in the dead of the night Jacob apparently was impressed with religious awe. No doubt this experience gave direction to his whole subsequent life. It would seem he felt the "Infinite."

Similarly Katek in his moment of despair after wrestling with the waves of the sea for several hours, felt the "Infinite." He was no longer able to hold on, when, it seems, he received in terms of his own cultural understanding a revelation of the "Infinite." The awefulness of the incident stimulated him to further effort, and hope and rescue were at hand. Although the divine revelation in both these stories was of comparatively short duration both their lives were changed, and they each turned to God. The desert tribal sheik founded a nation of religious people, the arctic hunter became a shaman. It is not recorded that either man received a further revelation, for it seems that God revealed himself

---

Expedition 1907. (Leyden: E.J.Bull Ltd. Printers and Publishers, 1907) (New York: J.E.Stechert and Co.,American Agent, 1907), pp. 218 ff.

[1]Gen. 32; 24 ff.

but infrequently to one person. However once a sense of the "mysterium" (as Rudolph Otto terms it), is experienced, sorrow, and gloom are dispersed, leaving the recipient a permanent hope and joy and confidence to face future predicaments. The pettiness of life ceases to bind him; he understands something which his own powers could not alone reveal.

The grotesque story of the Walrus, in the case of Katek and equally grotesque story of the ancient Hebrew God, are not important. The beliefs in such fantasies were but part of their respective cultural heritages. But the important thing is that they felt the power of the "Unseen."

These men did not get a formal expression of the way of life that satisfied their intellectual understanding, which would have been an end in itself, but they felt the "Infinite," which is abiding, and sustaining.

With reverence we ask; "Was not Jesus' experience, while forty days in the wilderness, another such awe inspiring experience, that revealed to him the truth and the light which sustained him to the end?"

Case History Illustrating Faith, Love and Mysticism

Case History of Nora Coonskin.--The following case history deals with the abstract human qualities of faith, hope, love and mysticism.

The Testimony of a Californian Indian woman: among

primitive peoples, as with ourselves, faith is evanescent. It comes and goes, fluctuating from nominal belief to deep intensity and conviction. It passes frequently from extreme to extreme. Nor can mystical states be sustained for any great length of time as William James points out.[1] Often the religious influences of childhood lie dormant for half a lifetime, retreating before the distracting activities of the daily living. Under the proper stimulation, the early sense or feeling of the mysterious is re-born, and one gets an insight of things unseen, which were evident enough at all times, but the significance of which was missed. If the stimulation to feeling is of the right sort and intense enough a change of life-habits is inevitable. The form which rebirth takes is according to the social setting of the recipient. This is well illustrated in the story of the Oxford graduate previously mentioned, and the following story related by Gladys Ayer Nomland[2] of a Californian Indian named Nora Coonskin. This woman Shaman was of the Athabascan group of Indians.

> My informant, has since died, aged 70 years. She was born at Bucksport, near Eureka, when her parents were making their way back from the Smith River reservation to the Bear River Territory. As a child of 10 or 12 years she was trained for a Shaman by her mother, also a Shaman, but had not put her training in use. In the summer of 1929 she said that spirits came to her and told her she must doctor sick people. They also told her they would help her and give her power equal to that

---

[1] James, op. cit., p. 380.

[2] Gladys Ayer Nomland, "Bear River Ethnography," Anthropological Records, Vol. 2, No. 2, University of California, (Berkeley, 1936), p. 1. passim.

of her dead mother, but that if she refused to doctor she would soon die. Her feeling against becoming a Shaman held her back from practicing for some time, but the compulsion of the spirits, and encouragement of her friends finally overcame her reluctance.

Nora relates: "When my brother was killed, I was sick, but went to the burial. I fainted. Doctor said I was dead, but he sang and danced and brought my spirit back and I recovered. During the sickness and death of my mother, I saw a woman about two feet tall, who I knew was my mother's half-sister, come to earth again. She died when I was very young, but I recognized her with the help of other Shaman's spirits. She was dressed in a blue cloud and wore feathers on her h ad. She spoke to me and said, 'You have trouble now, so I come to see you.' Then she walked into the brush. I looked around at other people to see if they had seen the spirits, but no one had seen anything."

Nora accounted for her ability to see spirits which were invisible to other people by saying, "I was trained for a doctor, so I could see." On another occasion, Nora related her own experience during an ecstacy:

"I saw a big lake, where spirits told me I must go to get the best power. I have to go there twice to dance and sing and swim in that lake. That lake you call Clear Lake. When I go there once more, spirits say that I am finished and I shall have great power. I can then doctor without singing or dancing. I can cure sick people by putting my hands on them or by spitting on my hands and rubbing the place where the pain is located. After I go once more, I can go any place and dance and sing whenever I want to. I cannot do anything more to gain power. My spirit travels and travels when I sleep, and when I dance and sing it tells me what I have to do and where I must go, and what is going to happen to me."

This story might easily be that of a Christian church goer, even to the dream. It is not related to what extent she had been acquainted with Christian teachings; probably she had. Apparently however she had retained something of her native tribal religious training of sixty years previously. Whether her parents had seen a missionary at this early date we do not know. Although the Russian Orthodox Greek church had established itself in Northern California prior to the conquest of California by the United States of America,

it is not recorded that they went inland far enough to come in contact with this branch of the Athabascan linguistic group of California Indians.

Be this as it may, the fact remains that in the story related above we see many characteristics that are fundamentally humanistic. First of all we note that this primitive soul was very womanly. She had love not of emotional kind; but that of "natural affection,"[1] which arises naturally and spontaneously in the lives of every human being. If it were not so it is inconceivable that the human race could have persisted.

Nora's love, although perhaps not altruistic as we understand the word, seems to have been unselfish, at least to the point where she was sympathetic to her people. The only note of self interest in the story is that; if she refused to doctor sick people she would die. However I prefer to translate this statement more charitably, as; "if I doctor my people I shall surely live." This pre-literate lady[2] seems also to have been endowed with faith, a faith in unseen things. She was reluctant to depend on her own powers of healing, but felt she could do so with the aid of her spiritual insight. The other factor necessary in her healing art was the faith

---

[1]It is recorded that most of the Northern and Central Californian group were very affectionate.

[2]The author does not say to what degree this woman was literate, but judging from the known fact that primitive peoples are very conservative in matters of religious belief, it is reasonably sure that she retained much of her early traditional religious training. Consequently, for our purpose we will consider her pre-literate.

of her people in her integrity.

This story also illustrates that peoples as low in the scale of civilization as the Californian Indians had this mutual love and community of interests that is basic to the moral code of any social group. As far as the records show, most primitives have this phase of co-operative activity well developed. It is impossible for one to conceive a social group existing without most of its members at least being/or co-operative having somewhat of mutuality or love and trust in each other. In fact the discipline of cooperative activity for the mutual benefit of the group appears to me to be the basis of all primitive social structures. Furthermore, it seems that the innate spiritual quality of love underlies all human society. It has its individual, as well as social aspects. It is for this reason that individual absolutism cannot prevail for any length of time.

I am well aware that in certain levels of human society there is a certain amount of conditioned cruelty and brutality which one cannot evaluate according to our understanding of higher ethics, but if one reads carefully much of so called cruelty is but a crude form of heroism or self discipline. This is illustrated by the scarification[1] of the body and the knocking out of the upper central incisor teeth of the Australian aborigines during their religious initiation ceremony.

---

[1] Scarification; See appendix.

Besides the above enumerated human qualities Nora seems to have had the mystic sense well developed, partly conditioned in her childhood no doubt, but residual within her individual self. She further seems to have been well aware of the sustaining effects of this irrational "Power," for without it she could perform no cures. Furthermore, her people reverence this mystical quality within her as significant, since the group recognized "Some Other" power beyond that of human.

Neurotic[1] Tendencies in Religion as Illustrated by Shamanism

It is notable but not often emphasized that many of the world's great religious leaders have been, more or less emotionally or nervously unstable, even to the point of manifesting pathological tendencies. It is well known that this is true also for geniuses in other fields of human activity. To mention a few such nervously unstable religious leaders, we call to mind Buddha, Mohammed, Saint Teresa, Saint Francis d'Assisi, John Bunyan, and George Fox. Perhaps the very intense mind which is not perfectly balanced is a better instrument for revealing spiritual insights than one that is normal. At least we know that God often uses this instrument

---

[1] The term neurotic is used here in its general sense; for non-pathological, yet certainly abnormal and emotionally unstable. Neurasthenic might be a better term to use.

See Neurasthenia; in appendix for further statement.

to reveal His truths. To this type of religious experience we are also indebted for many of our religious cults. The following case histories of Siberian Shamans deal with this neurotic phase of religious life among pre-literate peoples.

As William James[1] indicates, there is a close interdependence between the religious functions of the individual, and the institutional or tribal religious product.

Among the pre-literate peoples of the cold Siberian plains we have an excellent illustration of how this operates in an intense but somewhat negative way. It seems that the long dreary lifeless winters, and the specialized way of living, affects the people of these regions physiologically. Many of them suffer with special nervous troubles, leading to various kinds of neuroses. Throughout all history, and with all peoples we find many of the influential leaders of religion are definitely neurotic. It appears neuroticism among the Siberian natives is almost synonymous with religious inspiration.

The following episodes were recorded by W. Bogoras, a member of the Jessup North Pacific Expedition, who studied the Chuckchee peoples in 1907.

Case History of Ainenwat the Chuckchee.--

> The Shamanistic call manifests itself in various ways. Sometimes it is an inner voice which bids the person to enter into intercourse with the "spirits." If the person is dilatory in obeying, the calling spirit soon appears in some outward, visible shape, and communicates the call in a more explicit way. For instance, Ainenwat, says that at one time, after a severe illness, when his soul

---

[1] James, op. cit., p. 259 ff.

was ripe for inspiration, he saw several "spirits," but did not give much heed to the fulfillment of their address. Then a "spirit" came to him. He was gaunt, and black in color, and said that he was the "spirit" of reindeer scab. Ainenwat felt himself very much drawn toward the "spirit" and wanted him to stay and become his constant companion. The "spirit" hesitated at first, and then refused to stay. He said however, I may consent, if your desire for my company is strong enough, if you wish me enough to take the drum, to handle it for three days and three nights and to become a shaman. Ainenwat in his turn refused and the spirit immediately vanished.

The before mentioned Ainenwat also told me in 1884 he lost his whole family by small pox, but slept out himself for two weeks during which time he conversed with "spirits." Ainenwat was not careful enough to obey the instructions of the "spirits" who came to him with a supernatural silver knife of their own operation which freed him from all diseased matter. Hence, though he recovered his illness he had no further good fortune.-- he left his house and lived the last years of his life as a wandering hunter of wild reindeer.[1]

Case History of Niron the Chuckchee.--

Another Reindeer Chuckchee, Niron, had a Shamanistic call during his search for the herd which had run away in a thick fog. The search lasted several months, during which time, Niron suffered several hardships. He was without food for days, had no shelter in which to sleep, was drenched with rain, and was even without any fire or dry clothes. In his plight, he met several animals who acted like men and played various tricks on him. At last he met a Wolf who was eating from a carcass of a newly killed reindeer. The wolf took compassion on him saying that he knew well what hunger was. He bade him cut off the legs of the carcass, and feed on the sinew and the marrow. The carcass on its part, begged Niron not to touch it, promising to bring his herd as ransom. The wolf sneered at the proposition, saying that the Reindeer was too slow and it had allowed itself to be caught. Then Niron ate from the carcass. The wolf then promised to find the herd. After two weeks he again met Niron, and told him where to find the reindeer.

Immediately after the recovery of the herd, Niron slaughtered a fat doe and sacrificed it to the wolf. From that time on Niron considered himself as "one with a Spirit." He was a spendthrift, much given to card playing, and cared little for his herd or home, and the "spirits refused to believe that such a good for nothing could amount to much in the eyes of the "spirits." Niron him-

---

[1] Bogoras, The Chuckchee Religion, pp. 418 ff.

See Appendix; Shamanism.

self, however, often beat his drum, singing his tunes, and called the "spirits," not so much for any real purpose, but simply to keep up the useful relations with them and to avoid their displeasure.[1]

Suitability of a Particular Religion for a Particular Environment

One might study the religion of the Chuckchee people from the angle of the influence of environment, of local social tradition, nervous instability or what not. We propose to discuss the religion of these people from the viewpoint of religious philosophy.

Apparently the religion of this people has been in existence sufficiently long to become fairly satisfactory, and to supply the needs of its adherents. Whether it is a degenerate form of a purer religion, or influenced in any way by Christianity we have no means of knowing, but apparently it functions effectively and perhaps satisfactorily. This being the case apparently there was no stimulation for re-examination of this religion, even if this pre-literate people were capable of indulging in the philosophy of religion.

The theologians, as represented by the Shamans, were satisfied to sustain it, and the people to accept it; therefore it was valid for all concerned. Fortunately for our study the white man with his foreign economic or religious systems had not entirely disrupted this primitive social unit

---

[1] Bogoras, Ibid., p. 422.

at the time the above incidents were recorded in 1907, else perhaps those peoples might have begun revising their theology, as they would have had to do in order to meet new and changing conditions, just as we are at the present time doing with our own Christian theology. Judging from the history of many pre-literate peoples, and I am thinking of the South Sea Islanders in particular, they are not able to make the economic or religious transition; the result is that they themselves perish, and with them their culture and, for their needs, a perfectly good religion.[1]

A primitive religion has a legitimate and holy function to perform in its natural setting; like our own religion, in most cases it grew up with, fitted the needs of, and was the sustaining element of what was worthful to its adherents. The fact that the Chuckchee religion takes a neurotic[2] twist is immaterial; it is still a valid religion for these peoples. Margaret Mead[3] further illustrates this point for certain tribes in New Guinea.

---

[1] Prior to the advent of Christianity this evaluation would seem valid. In view of the fact of the more enlightened modern missionary efforts, of building on the best there is in religion of primitive peoples, this statement has only a pedagogical value. Often the culture and religion of a tribe is swamped or destroyed by another tribe. More frequently, however, all tribal cultures and religions are modified by the diffusion and absorption methods. Margaret Mead informs me that in New Guinea, a complete and whole cultural complex is often bought by the inland dwelling people from visiting coastal tribes. However, I do not take this statement very seriously.

[2] Neurotic; See appendix under Neurasthenia

[3] Margaret Mead, Sex and Temperament in Three Primitive Societies. The Arapesh, the Mundugumor, the Tchanbuli; (New York: W. Morrow and Co., 1925), p. 310 ff.

Like the other case histories already studied, we find similar elements of religious insight or appreciation. On the social side, we find the elements of loyalty both to belief in the visionary experience, and loyalty to human friends as in the case of reluctance of some parents to dedicate the child to arduous religious service.[1]

There are two religious elements at conflict here, one the love of offspring versus the love of God, for not being a sophisticated people their faith was strong. Another socio-religious element was the respect of and for the person that implies freedom. Although a stabilizing influence might be brought to bear by others, as, in the case of the adolescent visionaries, nevertheless each person had a free choice of his loyalties, love, and faith. From a metaphysical viewpoint these peoples might be classified as supernaturalists, or mystics. Both the stories of Ainenwat and Niron show that these persons had reverence for the traditional orthodox faith in "Spirits Beyond." Neither questioned the powers or authority of those other worldly spirits, yet Ainenwat disobeyed them to his sorrow. From the mystical viewpoint these people seem as a group to be susceptible to intense feeling or emotional responses to the "Source of being." These people believe in a non-analytical penetrating insight. From experience these factors seemed to be for these people the basic source of insight. It will be noted there is no evidence of attempt to reason why or analyze religion with these people,

---

[1]See Appendix; Chuckchee Shamans.

as was the case with Crashing Thunder previously mentioned. I think it will further be seen that although these people make no logical attempt to understand or classify their theological beliefs, they do accept "spirits" as revealing the way of life, based on inner certitude arising from experience. That is to say, these votaries having surrendered all to the Gods they know, have a firm faith abiding conviction, which is in a sense, reality to them, or as Walter Marshall Horton[1] might express it, visionary experiences to the Chuckchee peoples are the "Object of religious experience."

---

[1] William Marshall Horton, A Psychological Approach to Theology, (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1932), p. 5.

CHAPTER VI

SUMMARY

With false pride, born of his wonderful achievements, civilized man looks down upon the humbler members of mankind. Because he has discovered some of nature's secrets, he regards with pity those who have not succeeded so well, and must eke out a meagre existence from forest, plain or sea.

It is a naïve assumption that civilized man is so very important. For one thing, it is not many generations since our own ancestors were roaming the forests of Europe clothed in little more than a coat of blue woad. On the other hand, more than one youth with pre-literate parents has attained Cambridge University. Neither can the average civilized man endure the physical hardships of the uncivilized; in fact, he often goes to pieces under such stress.

According to Franz Boas, Theodore Waitz in Anthropologie der Naturvolker (1877) was the first to point out that, in the main, the mental characteristics of man are the same all over the world.[1] Apparently the mind of man does not vary much in organization, but seems throughout to be at about the same stage of evolutionary development. For example, the pre-literate mind is capable of original thought

---

[1]Franz Boas, The Mind of Primitive Man, (New York: The Macmillan Co., 1924), p. 106.

and can reason; it can concentrate with much attention; it can inhibit or restrain impulses, at least to some degree, just as the sophisticated man does. Last, but not least, he can and does originate new religions, and according to Dr. Boas, produces prophets.[1] The difference between civilized and primitive man then appears to be one of physical and social setting. Consequently, it would seem that in the sight of God, the difference between the humblest savage and the greatest philosopher in their respective relations to God, is as the numeral one is to infinity.

Whatever the mental, physical or cultural differences are between savage and civilized man, there is, I gather from the studies of pre-literate religions, very little difference in reverence for God. Furthermore, in spite of strange methods of worship, seemingly beneath it all they worship the same God as we do. After all, why should this not be so, if we Christians are to believe in one God, maker of heaven and earth, and all that is therein; pre-literate peoples being obviously therein? It would seem to me that at some time in the past when by evolutionary process proto-man's nervous system became sufficiently developed so as to catch the tones and overtones from the spiritual world, that then he became a self-conscious, spiritually endowed recipient of God's favor, that is, "man." What he has done with his divine inspiration is another matter, of historical import only. On the other hand, it is inconceivable that any organic creature

---

[1]Boas, Ibid., p. 106.

could have developed to the point where it could have approached or conceived of God of itself. At least, we have no record of such a case, notwithstanding the various theories to the contrary advanced by psychologists and anthropologists concerning the origin of God and religion.

Marked by reasonable certainty, on the other hand, we do have the assurance from many persons of having experienced God in some way or another. Some such insights have been had from religious mystics, some from children, not yet moulded into the conventional social pattern, some from young lovers, some from great scientists, and some from students who for long years have meditated on spiritual things.

To further strengthen this argument, we have found in the foregoing study that pre-literate man also knows God, who, it seems to me, is universally the same God for all peoples, no matter how lowly in the scale of human advancement. Furthermore, pre-literate man's understanding of God is not relative to ours, since he has been inspired by the same God. The relative difference, it seems to me, is due in all cases to man's limited nervous capacity, and to a degree, to his lack of complete success in understanding his natural physical and cultural environment.

Again, to my knowledge, it is not recorded that God has withdrawn His spiritual blessing from any peoples or person. We do recognize, however, that some persons and peoples are better attuned to heavenly inspiration. This is shown in the case of the testaments for God which we have been discussing.

One might discuss interminably the similarities and differences between pre-literate and civilized man relative to belief and practice in religious matters. In the main, however, we have pointed out that all pre-literate people can experience God, reverence, worship, and depend on Him. Furthermore, all our pre-literate subjects understand, appreciate, and practice, often to a very high degree, the basic human characteristics connected with religion, namely; love, sympathy, goodness, truth, integrity, and they appreciate the beautiful.

CHAPTER VII

CONCLUSION

Unfortunately the scarcity of religious testimonies from pre-literate people makes it impossible to treat the subject from a purely scientific viewpoint. This is regrettable since no conclusion is possible.

In gathering such testimonies, one has to overcome the natural reticence of simple folk in speaking of intimate and personal things. Therefore, great skill is required in acquiring the facts. This is particularly true of religious matters, since tribal religious beliefs are often associated with secret rites. Another difficulty in obtaining authentic testimonies is the fact that the literate examiner has not lived sufficiently long with the primitive peoples to get the significance of their statements, and furthermore is likely to misinterpret a statement in terms of his own particular religious background. However, the fact remains that pre-literate man does recognize that there is a spiritual world as well as a visible world, as our few illustrations show. It would seem from our studies that his religion is part of the whole man. This involves the physiological state, the psychological attitude, the mental perception and the social milieu. It would further appear that pre-literate man is well aware of another higher universe than his immediate

visible one, and that he uses similar technics, as does literate man, to approach the spiritual. Some such technics are: prayer, meditation, fasting, ceremonials, private and social worship. The fact that they are often crude and sometimes brutal is not of material significance, for they have a pragmatic value. At what period in time the biological entity "man" evolved to the point where he could respond to the external world is beyond the scope of present philosophical knowledge. As our studies show pre-literate man has also speculated on his physical and spiritual beginnings. Our own speculation would be that physiological man could not in infinite time evolve himself to the point where he was receptive to the divine spark which fired him into humanity.

Whether religion is revealed we have no way of knowing. Some authors think not.[1] It is within the scope of logical speculation to imagine man as having evolved in some past time to the point of completeness where a mutation occurred and he was able to catch the tones and overtones of the divine spirit which govern the universe.

To use the modern radio as a rough analogy, physiological man is the mechanism, the mind of man is the antennae which receive the spirit from without; individual psychology and social development are the means of expressing life in its varying degrees of fullness. In this sense religion is re-

---

[1] This negative view is taken by Julian Huxley. Julian Huxley, Religion without Revelation, (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1927), passim.

vealed, and not by fiat. Thus, every vision has meaning to social and spiritual life. Therefore it would seem that pre-literate man as well as literate is not submerged in his tribal life, but sees life in spiritual as well as objective terms. It is the mutual interaction of the individual on the social, and the social on the individual which is of tremendous influence in developing the religious life. It is impossible to conceive of physical man in solitude becoming religious. Thus it is that religious consciousness is built up.

We further find that moral precepts are common to all men, pre-literate and literate, and that they have a religious as well as a social basis, as illustrated in the foregoing pages from the testimonies of pre-literate man. It would seem that religion and social life react cumulatively for the best. In society man becomes personally religious when he becomes aware of his conscious self. Thus it is that religious values are largely social. These values seem to have arisen out of the needs of man and are the outcome of various processes of social activity which are aroused by all sorts of objects of general interest and concern, both material and immaterial. In this sense the form religion takes is the result of the social setting and so gives values both to the individual and the group.

From another angle religion has a practical function. Pragmatically, religion is built up out of the larger meanings of experience, and I believe that pre-literate man acted on

this hypothesis without being aware of it as a philosophical principle. After all, was not the religion of Jesus largely practical?

Finally, in studying our primitive subjects it seems that the means God has of revealing his truths are unlimited. In addition to the well known methods of revelation through Nature, society, history, and the mind of normal man, the unhealthy mind can be used as an instrument for revealing truth, as we saw in the illustrations from the Siberian Shamans.

Although the subject matter of this thesis has not been exhausted, it may give an indication of the lessons which can be learned from the religion of primitive man, and may serve as a basis for further study.

APPENDIX

A Christian Mystical Experience

"I fasted much," Fox says, "walked abroad in solitary places many days, and often took my Bible, and sat in hollow trees and lonesome places until night came on; and frequently in the night walked mournfully about by myself; for I was a man of sorrows in the time of the first workings of the Lord in me.

"During all this time I was never joined in profession of religion with any, but gave up myself to the Lord, having forsaken all evil company, taking leave of father and mother, and all other relations, and traveled up and down as a stranger on the earth, which way the Lord inclined my heart; taking a chamber to myself in the town where I came, and tarrying sometimes more, sometimes less in a place: for I durst not stay long in a place, being afraid both of professor and profane, lest, being a tender young man, I should be hurt by conversing much with either. For which reason I kept much as a stranger, seeking heavenly wisdom and getting knowledge from the Lord; and was brought off from outward things, to rely on the Lord alone. As I had forsaken the priests, so I left the separate preachers also, and those called the most experienced people; for I saw there was none among them all that could speak to my condition. And when all my hopes in them and in all men were gone so that I had nothing outwardly to help me, nor could tell what to do; then, Oh then, I heard a voice which said, 'There is one, even Jesus Christ, that can speak to thy condition.' When I heard it, my heart did leap for joy. Then the Lord let me see why there was none upon the earth that could speak to my condition. I had not fellowship with any people, priests, nor professors, nor any sort of separated people. I was afraid of all carnal talk and talkers, for I could see nothing but corruptions. When I was in the deep, under all shut up, I could not believe that I should ever overcome; my troubles, my sorrows, and my temptations were so great that I often thought I should have despaired, I was so tempted. But when Christ opened to me how he was tempted by the same devil, and had overcome him, and has crushed his head; and that through him and his power, life, grace, and spirit, I

should overcome also, I had confidence in him. If I had had a king's diet, palace, and attendance, all would have been as nothing; for nothing gave me comfort but the Lord by his power. I saw professors, priests, and people were whole and at ease in that condition which was my misery, and they loved that which I would have been rid of. But the Lord did stay my desires upon himself, and my care was cast upon him alone."[1]

Chuckchee Shamanism

According to W. Bogoras:[2]

The Shamanistic call begins to manifest itself at an early age, in many cases, during the critical period of transition from childhood to youth. It is also a period of rapid and intense growth, and it is well known that many persons of both sexes manifest during this time increased sensitivity, and that the mind often becomes unbalanced. It is easy to understand that this critical period of human life, which is always full of unexpected changes and developments, is peculiarly adapted to the first implantation of Shamanistic inspiration. . . . . .

Nervous and highly excitable temperaments are most susceptible of the Shamanistic call. The Shamans among the Chuckchee with whom I have conversed were as a rule extremely excitable, almost hysterical, and not a few of them were half crazy. . . . .

Their cunning in the use of deceit in their art closely resembled the cunning lunatic.

The Chuckchee say that young persons destined to receive Shamanistic inspiration may be recognized at a very early age, even in their teens, by their gaze, which during conversation, is not turned to the listener, but is fixed on something beyond him. In connection with this, they say that the eyes of the Shaman have a different look from that of other people, and they explain the assertion that the eyes of the Shaman are very bright, which by the way, gives them the ability to see "spirits" even in the dark. The Chuckchee are well aware of the extreme nervousness of their Shamans, and express it by a special word meaning ("he is bashful"). By this word they mean to convey the idea that the Shaman is highly sensitive even to the slightest change of psychic atmosphere surrounding him during his exercises.

---

[1] James, op.cit., p. 335, quoting George Fox, Journal, abridged, (Philadelphia, 1800), pp. 59-61.

[2] W. Bogoras, "The Chuckchee Religion," Memoirs of American Museum of Natural History. Vol.XI. Part II. (New York: J. E. Stechert and Co., 1907), p. 420. passim.

The Shamanist "spirits" are likewise described as "fleeting" meaning that they want to flee beyond every unusual face or voice. "Kelet" belongs to the wilderness, say the Shamans, just as much as any wild animal. This is the reason they are fleeting.

The process of gathering inspiration is so painful to young Shamans, because of their mutual struggle against the call that they are sometimes said to sweat blood on the forehead and temples.

The Individual in a Pre-literate Social Group.

Dr. Irving King, The Development of Religion, New York; 1910 is a representative of the view point of some of the earlier anthropologists, concerning the importance of the individual in a pre-literate society. The following quotations will suffice to show his trend of thought on this subject:

> So completely is this true, that the primitive man can hardly have been definitely conscious of values which were not supported and shared by the group of which he was a part. A direct result of such a condition would be a vague, indefinite sense of his own personality. p.66.

Again, on page 221, Dr. King says:

> It has been shown that the primitive religious attitude is more or less objective, due to the fact that society, in its earlier stages, is organized so exclusively with reference to acute objective interests. Here the individual is not clearly differentiated from the group. As a separate personality he has no validity; his religious interests, feelings, and concepts he shares with the rest of his tribe; purely personal desires and appreciations of worthfulness he can scarcely have, or, if he does have them, they are unstable and transient because they can find no place in the organized religion of his social milieu.

Again he says on page 330, "The primitive individual, as we have seen, is submerged in his tribe. The deities care for the social group rather than for the separate persons which compose it. . . . .

Dr. Robert H. Lowie in Primitive Religion, Chapter XI, New York; 1924 adequately refutes the above viewpoint. The following quotation is the first paragraph of a long well illustrated chapter on "Individual Variability," in pre-literate groups.

> Useful, nay indispensable, as is the historico-sociological point of view for an understanding of the individual's religious life, there are limits to its potency. The individual is not merged (completely) in his social milieu,--he reacts to it as an individual, that is, differently from every other group member. The cultural tradition of his people dominates him, but it is reflected in a distinctive fashion by each psyche. Were it otherwise, novel conceptions could never arise. It is reckoned one of the most epoch-making steps in the history of psychology that Galton investigated mind not in the abstract but in its varying manifestations among different personalities. For too long a time it has been customary to ignore corresponding differences in primitive peoples on the familiar principle that "all Chinamen look alike." Only in quite recent years men like Dr. R. R. Marett in England, Dr. W. D. Wallis in America, Fathers Wilhelm Schmidt and W. Koppers in Austria, have insisted that what holds among us also holds in ruder levels of culture.

Neurasthenia

The following quotation is taken from Irving J. Sands, M. D. and Phyllis Blanchard, Ph. D. Abnormal Behavior, p.151 ff., New York: Moffat, Yard and Company, 1923.

> The neurotics are those fearful, indecisive, constantly complaining individuals, who show a fundamental weakness and lack of stamina. They try to compensate for their deficiencies by assuming a set of virtues which are not natural to their personality, and are therefore overdone and patently artificial. Instead of being punctual they arrive ahead of time; instead of being rapid and efficient, they are so methodical as to be slow. They replace a wholesome regard for cleanliness by over-fastidiousness; lacking a wholesome sense of honesty and moral integrity, they become the type known in vernacular

as "goody-goodys," and are scrupulous about unnecessary details.

Adler has devoted a whole book to a description of the neurotic and a theory as to the underlying causes for the development of this type of personality. According to this author, the neurotic constitution is characterised by organic deficiencies which impair the general physique of the individual. This physical defect gives rise to a feeling of insufficiency and inability to cope with the struggle for existence, and thus produces the fearful, vacillating type of individual whom we have described in the preceding paragraph. This theory of the neurotic constitution and personality is confirmed by the fact that the developmental history of many neurotics gives a typical picture of a delicate and sickly infancy period, with prolonged enuresis and other physical symptoms.

Like the neurotic, the psychoneurotic personality is lacking in certain fundamental characteristics which make for strength and stability. The symptoms of the psychoneurotic patient are at their source an indication of the inability of the individual to face the hardships of reality. Sensitive, easily discouraged, shrinking from pain, these personalities take refuge in day-dreaming, in hysterical manifestations, minor "nervous breakdowns," etc., in order to escape from the unpleasant situations which are often a part of life. . . . .

The neurotics and psychoneurotics, although unpleasant personalities in many ways, seldom become definitely anti-social in overt action. They develop minor mental disorders, such as phobias (abnormal fears), morbid obsessions (irresistible impulse to certain habits of behavior), hysterical attacks, anxiety neuroses, etc.

The following incidental note may be of interest.

There is a decided susceptibility of the Hebrew Race to Neurasthenia, due to an unfavorable environment in the preceding or present generation, and to the intense struggle of this race for financial independence. Quoted from The Cyclopedia of Medicine p. 99, Vol., 9. George Morris Piersol, M. D., Editor in Chief, Philadelphia: F. A. Davis, 1937.

Dr. Westphal of Centerville informs me this is notoriously so among Hebrew clinical patients in the city of Los Angeles.

The most frequent causes for Neurasthenesia are worry, anxiety, or dissatisfaction with some important factor in the patient's environment.

Peyote Cult

The following statement is taken from Robert H. Lowie, Primitive Religion, p. 200.

> The peyote, incorrectly called "mescal," is a species of small cactus that grows along the lower Rio Grande and in Mexico. It resembles a radish in size and shape and has a white blossom, which is displaced by a tuft of white down. North of the Mexican boundary only the top is used, being sliced and dried to form the "button," while in Mexico the whole of the plant is sliced, dried and used in decoction. The Peyote worship centers in the eating of the button or drinking of its infusion. Professor Kroeber, who partook of peyote among the Arapaho, thus describes its effects:
>
> "It affects the heart, produces muscular lassitude, is a strong stimulant of the nervous system, and has a marked effect on the general feeling of the person, giving the impression of stimulating especially the intellectual faculties. In most cases it produces visions of a kaleidoscopic nature. Its emotional effect varies greatly, being in some cases depressing or intensely disagreeable; in others, which are the more frequent, producing quiet but intense exaltation. There is little subsequent reaction.'

For further references on this subject see Radin, Crashing Thunder, p. 109. Also see James H. Leuba, A Psychological Study of Religion, (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company Inc., n.d.), p. 23, quoting Wier Mitchell, "The Effect of Anhalonium Lewinii," British Medical Journal, Vol.II. (1906), pp. 1624-8.

Scarification

Scarification is a form of mutilation of the body practiced by many savage peoples. In some cases it is associated with a religious, or tribal initiatory rite. More often it is practiced for purely decorative purposes.

The process consists of cutting deeply into the fleshy parts of the body, and rubbing into the freshly made wound, ochre or other colored earth, or even charcoal. When the wound heals, it leaves a thick welt. Many tribes, particularly those of Northern Australia, cut many such wounds according to a definite pattern.

B. Spencer and F. J. Gillan in their book The Northern Tribes of Central Australia (London: 1904), describe this process in detail for the Australian aborigines.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Binyon, Lawrence. The Spirit of Man in Asian Art. Boston: Harvard University Press, 1935.

*Boas, Franz. The Mind of Primitive Man. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1924.

*Bogoras, W. The Chuckchee Religion. Memoirs of the American Museum of Natural History. Vol.XI. Part II. Reprint from Vol.III. Part II of the Publications of the Jesup North Pacific Expedition. 1907. pp. 218 et. seq. Leyden: E. J. Bull Ltd., Printers and Publishers,1907. New York: J. E. Stechert & Co., American Agent,1907.

*Brinton, Daniel G. Religions of Primitive Peoples. G. P. Putnam's Sons. London and New York: The Knickerbocker Press, 1899.

*Brown, A. H. The Andaman Islanders. Cambridge, England,1922.

Buckham, John Wright. Christianity and Personality. New York: Round Table Press, 1936.

Buermeyer, Lawrence. The Aesthetic Experience. Merion,Pa.: The Barnes Foundation, 1924.

*Clodd, Edward. Animism. Chicago: The Open Court Publishing Company, 1906.

*Codrington, R. H. The Melanesians. Oxford: 1891.

Crawley, Ernest. Oath, Curse, and Blessing. London: Watts & Co., 1934.

* Cyclopedia of Medicine. Vol. 9. Piersol, George Morris. Editor in Chief. Philadelphia: F. A. Davis, 1937.

Dewey, John. Human Nature and Conduct. New York: Henry Holt & Co., 1922.

*Durkheim, Emile. The Elementary Forms of Religious Life. Translated by Joseph Ward Swain. The Macmillan Company. London: George Allen & Unwin., Lt.,n.d.

Farrell, L. R. The Evolution of Religion. Covent Garden, London: Williams & Norgate, 1905.

*Flower, Cyril J. An Approach to the Psychology of Religion. New York: Harcourt, Brace & Company Inc., 1927.

*Quoted in text.

*Frazer, James George, Sir. Folk-Lore in the Old Testament. Abridged Edition. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1923.

Groves, Ernest R., and Blanchard, Phyllis. Readings in Mental Hygiene. New York: Henry Holt & Company, 1936.

Hocking, William Ernest. Human Nature and its Remaking. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1918.

*Hocking, William Ernest. The Meaning of God in Human Experience. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1912.

Hopkins, Washburn E. Origin and Evolution of Religion. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1924.

*Horton, William Marshall. A Psychological Approach to Theology. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1932.

Huxley, J. S. Religion Without Revelation. New York and London: Harper & Brothers Publishers, 1927.

*James, E. O. Primitive Ritual and Beliefs. London: Metheun Co., 1917.

*James, William. The Varieties of Religious Experience. A Study in Human Nature. (Revised Ed., 1916, 27th Impression). New York: Longmans, Green & Co., 1902.

*Jevons, Frank Byron. The Idea of God in Early Religions. Cambridge University Press: G.P.Putnam's Sons, 1912.

*Keith, Sir Arthur. The Antiquity of Man. 2 Vols. Philadelphia: J. P. Lippencott Co., 1925.

*King, Irving. The Development of Religion. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1910.

*Kroeber, A. L. Anthropology. New York: Harcourt, Brace & Co., 1922.

*Lang, Andrew. The Making of Religion. Third Edition. London: Longmans, Green & Co., 1909.

*Leyburn, James G. Handbook of Ethnography. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1931.

*Leuba, James H. The Psychology of Religious Mysticism. New York: Harcourt, Brace & Co., Inc., 1925.

*Lowie, Robert H. Primitive Religion. New York: Boni & Liveright, 1924.

*Lowie, Robert H. Primitive Society. New York: Boni & Liveright, 1920.

Macintosh, Douglas Clyde. The Reasonableness of Christianity. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1925.

Macintosh, Douglas C. et. al. Religious Realism. Edited by Douglas Macintosh. New York: The Macmillan Co.,1931.

Malinowski, Bronislaw. The Foundation of Faith and Morals. University of Durham: Riddle Memorial Lectures. Oxford University Press. London: Humphrey Milford, 1936.

Malinowski, Bronislaw. Science Religion and Reality. Edited by Joseph Needham. New York: The Macmillan Co.,1925.

Menninger, Karl A. The Human Mind. The Literary Guild of America, 1930.

*Marett, R. R. Faith, Hope, and Charity in Primitive Religion. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1932.

*Marett, R. R. Anthropology. London: Henry Holt & Co.,1911.

*Marett, R. R. Psychology and Folk-Lore. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1920.

*Marett, R. R. The Threshold of Religion. Third Edition. London: Methuen & Co., Ltd., 1914.

*Mead, Margaret. Sex and Temperament in Three Primitive Societies. New York: W. Morrow & Co., 1935.

*Moore, George Fort. The Birth and Growth of Religion. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1928.

*Nomland, Gladys Ayer. Bear River Ethnography. Berkeley: Anthropological Records, Vol. 2. No. 2, 1938. University of California.

*Otto, Rudolf. The Idea of the Holy. London and New York: Humphrey Milford, 1928.

*Otto, Rudolf. Mysticism East and West. New York: The Macmillan Co., n.d.

Parkman, Francis. The Oregon Trail. New York: Farrer & Rinehart on Murray Hill, 1931.

*Paterson, W. P. The Nature of Religion. Gifford Lectures. 1924-1925. New York: George H. Doran Co., 1924.

*Pratt, J. B. The Religious Consciousness. New York: Publisher Unknown, 1921.

*Radin, Paul. Religion of North American Indians. Journal of American Folk-Lore. Vol. XXVII. No. CVI., October-December, 1914.

*Radin, Paul. Journal of Religious Psychology. Vol.7. No.1

Radin, Paul. Literary Aspects of North American Mythology. Ottawa: Canada Department of News. Museum Bulletin No. 16. Anthropological Series, No. 6. June 15, 1915. Ottawa Government Printing Bureau.

*Radin, Paul. Crashing Thunder. The Autobiography of an American Indian. New York and London: D. Appleton & Co., 1926.

*Robinson, Theodore H. An Outline Introduction to the History of Religions. Oxford University Press: Humphrey Milford, 1926.

Royce, Josiah. The Sources of Religious Insight. Cross Lectures, 1911. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1923.

Rylands, Gordon L. The Evolution of Christianity. London: Watts & Co., 1927.

*Sands, Irving J., and Blanchard, Phyllis. Abnormal Behavior. New York: Moffat, Yard & Co., 1923.

*Schmidt, Wilhelm. "The Origin of the Idea of God" in Anthropos. Vol. III, IV. 1908-1909.

*Schmidt, Wilhelm. The Origin and Growth of Religion. Trans. H. J. Rose. New York: 1931.

*Sellars, Roy Wood. Religion Coming of Age. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1928.

*Shaffer, Laurance Fredrick. The Psychology of Adjustment. New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., Cambridge, Mass.: The Riverside Press, 1936.

*Smith, Eliot. The Evolution of Man. Humphrey Milford. London: Oxford University Press, 1924.

*Smith, Harrold F. The Elements of Comparative Theology. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1937.

Smuts, General Jan C. Holism and Evolution. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1926.

*Spencer, B., and Gillen, F. J. The Northern Tribes of Central Australia. London: 1904.

*Thomas, N. W. Natives of Australia. London: Archibald Constable & Co., Ltd., 1906.

Tsanoff, Radoslav A. The Problem of Immortality. Studies in Personality and Value. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1924.

*Tylor, E. B. Primitive Culture. 2 Vols. London: Watts & Co., 1913.

*Tylor, Sir Edward B. Anthropology. 2 Vols. London: Watts & Co., 1881.

Watson, John. Christianity and Idealism. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1897.

Westermarck, Edward. Ritual and Belief in Morocco. 2 Vols. London: Macmillan & Co., Ltd., 1926.

Widgery, Alban G. The Comparative Study of Religions. William & Norgate, 1923.

Wieman, Henry Nelson, and Meland, Eugene Bernard. American Philosophies of Religion. New York: Willett, Clark & Co., 1936.

Wieman, Henry Nelson, and Wieman, Regna Westcott. Normative Psychology of Religion. New York: Thomas V. Crowell Co., 2nd Printing 1935.

*Wissler, Clark. Man and Culture. New York: Thomas V. Crowell Co., 1923.

Whittaker, Thomas. The Origins of Christianity. London: Watts & Co., 1933.

*Young, Edward . . . The Complaint and Consolation of Night Thoughts on Life, Death and Immortality. Boston: Cosby, Nichols, Lee and Co., 1860.

Zwemer, Samuel M. The Origin of Religion. Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1935.

End of

A study of some of the universal religious tendencies in pre-literate man

This title was preceded by

The theological basis of Christian ethics in Emil Brunner

And is continued by

Religious education : Arlington Avenue Fellowship House

Search by title on archive.org to continue reading this collection of Pacific School of Religion Theses from 1939
call number Thesis Cage 1939 v.2